



Final Report

GVA
81 Fountain Street
Manchester
M2 2EE



North East Lincolnshire Retail, Leisure and Three Centres Study

North East Lincolnshire Council

June 2013

CONTENTS

1.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
2.	RETAIL AND LEISURE TRENDS.....	3
3.	PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK	10
4.	FLOORSPACE SURVEYS.....	13
5.	RETAIL CAPACITY METHODOLOGY.....	25
6.	GRIMSBY	35
7.	CLEETHORPES.....	63
8.	IMMINGHAM	82
9.	TOWN CENTRE DEVELOPMENT FRAMEWORKS.....	91
10.	STRATEGIC RECOMMENDATIONS.....	102

APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1 RETAIL CATCHMENT PLAN

APPENDIX 2 CONVENIENCE ASSESSMENT

A) POPULATION AND SPEND DATA B) MARKET SHARE ANALYSIS C) CAPACITY MODELLING

APPENDIX 3 COMPARISON ASSESSMENT

A) POPULATION AND SPEND DATA B) MARKET SHARE ANALYSIS C) CAPACITY MODELLING

APPENDIX 4 TOWN CENTRE FLOORSPACE PLANS

APPENDIX 5 PROPOSED TOWN CENTRE BOUNDARY PLANS

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 GVA was appointed by North East Lincolnshire Council in April 2013 to prepare a borough-wide retail, leisure and three centres study. The study is to provide part of the evidence base for the retail and leisure policies and proposals to be set out in the emerging new Local Plan. The terms of the study brief are as follows:
- To establish current shopping (convenience and comparison) and leisure expenditure patterns in the borough through commissioning a new household telephone survey.
 - Provide a review of the vitality and viability of the three main centres in the borough through completing new floorspace / fascia surveys to establish centre composition.
 - Provide a comparative assessment of the changes in market share, performance and floorspace composition of centres against the 2005 Study findings.
 - To assess the future quantitative capacity and qualitative need for additional retail and leisure floorspace across the borough over the new Local Plan period (2030), having regard to new and planned developments / commitments.
 - To provide strategic advice on overall future needs and confirm an appropriate development and investment framework strategy for the borough as a whole and its three main centres.
- 1.2 The study is informed by a detailed household telephone survey exercise which underpins the quantitative component of the study, identifying the current market share performance of the main centres and individual stores. The ability to quantify the survey results in monetary terms enables a detailed understanding of the implications for potential expenditure growth in relation to existing and planned convenience and comparison retail floorspace provision.
- 1.3 The results of the full quantitative analysis and qualitative appraisal along with the identification of planned and proposed improvements in competing centres, are drawn together to provide a set of recommendations to enable the Council to proactively plan for future development.
- 1.4 However, the conclusions of the study do represent a 'point-in-time' assessment of performance and opportunity. The quantitative need identified should be used to inform policy which will endure over the short to medium term as required. However, it will be
-

important that the Council continues to monitor the health of its centres through its forward planning function, revisiting the strategy to address changing circumstances.

REPORT STRUCTURE

- 1.5 In accordance with the terms of the Study Brief this report is structured as follows:

PART ONE – BACKGROUND DETAIL AND CONTEXT

- **SECTION 2 – RETAIL TRENDS;** summarises the current market conditions and developments within the retail and leisure sector.
- **SECTION 3 – PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK;** sets out the emerging national and local planning policy framework which will inform preparation of the emerging plan.

PART TWO – QUALITATIVE ASSESSMENT

- **SECTION 4 – HEALTHCHECK ASSESSMENT;** assesses the changes in floorspace / fascia composition of the main town centres in the borough. The assessment seeks to comparatively assess and benchmark against Experian Goad regional averages.

PART THREE – QUANTITATIVE ASSESSMENT

- **SECTION 5 – RETAIL CAPACITY METHDOLOGY;** sets out the methodology underpinning the quantitative capacity modelling exercise.
- **SECTIONS 6 – 8 – CENTRE SPECIFIC ANALYSIS;** reviews and comparatively assesses changes in market share and performance of the respective centres since the 2005 Study. The need / capacity for new provision within the specific centres are identified, having regard to forward growth and planned / emerging commitments within the borough.
- **SECTION 9 – TOWN CENTRE DEVELOPMENT FRAMEWORKS;** sets out the proposed framework for development in the three primary centres in the borough.
- **SECTION 10 – STRATEGIC RECOMMENDATIONS;** proposes changes to the borough hierarchy, town centre boundaries, frontage policies and local impact threshold.

- 1.6 The next section therefore sets out the current retail and leisure trends which will influence the future performance of centres and forward strategy.

2. RETAIL AND LEISURE TRENDS

- 2.1 The study has been commissioned in part to assess the impact of the economic climate on retail and leisure provision across the borough and how the wider economic and social trends likely to influence both local residents and operator requirements in the future. This section therefore examines key trends and drivers for change in the retail industry and outlines those of particular relevance to the borough. The review draws on a range of published data sources including research by Verdict, Mintel and Experian.

ECONOMIC OUTLOOK

- 2.2 The latest advice published by Experian (Retail Planner 10.1, September 2012) presents a bleak picture for the economy as the recovery from the recession continues to be weak. It is anticipated that household spending will continue to be constrained by subdued disposable income growth and a weak labour market. Pressures on disposable incomes will limit the extent to which consumers are able to save and consumers will therefore be more considered with their spending decisions and seeking to achieve best value for money. In many circumstances, the cost-savings offered by the Internet will be more readily seized.
- 2.3 Overall, consumers remain cautious with spending not only on discretionary items but also on needs, cutting wastage, which will impact on food & grocery volumes. There is an increased focus on buying efficiently. Big ticket and home-related purchases remain low, particularly as uncertainty continues to drive house prices and volumes down, as many are reluctant to move (stagnant housing market and limited availability of finance).
- 2.4 As the housing market recovery remains slow and uncertain, certain sectors (e.g. home furnishing and DIY) may benefit from increasing demand as home owners prioritise renovation of existing property rather than moving. However, it is anticipated that sales through the town centre will remain weak with online and out of centre retailers continuing to take a greater share. Space and store numbers in town centre locations are also expected to decline as retailers drive efficiencies by closing underperforming space (notable closures include Focus DIY and Comet); these trends are discussed in more detail below.

THE INTERNET / 'E-TAILING'

- 2.5 Consistent with wider economic trends, growth in e-Retail declined in 2009 as a result of the recession reducing consumer demand. Austerity cuts on the spending ability of the most prolific online shoppers (35-44 year olds) also had an impact on reduced demand during this period. Overall the pace of growth in online shopping is set to slow down significantly as the channel matures and competition increases¹.
- 2.6 Despite overall more modest levels of growth in online shopping, there will continue to remain reasonable pressure on traditional bricks and mortar retailers. Shoppers are able to select their own retail mix online and shopping centres and high streets will need to compete with this choice, which is not only driven by price and range, but also service and expertise. Online shopping has driven expectations of convenience and service upwards and customers are expecting more from in-store ambience to tempt them to make a purchase². Town centres and high streets will increasingly have to provide a shopping 'experience' that the Internet is unable to match.
- 2.7 Trends also show that the online and in-store shopping channels are becoming gradually more blurred as shoppers increasingly research purchases online or in stores which are increasingly becoming showrooms. According to Verdict, in 2010, 63% of shoppers researched goods online before purchasing in stores, an increase from 54% in 2007. At the same time, it is estimated that 29% of consumers researched purchases in store before buying online, representing a huge increase from 13% in 2007³.

NEW TECHNOLOGIES

- 2.8 Technological advances will continue to drive changes in retailing, with greater interactions between work, entertainment, social networking and shopping using mobile devices. Quick Response codes (QR codes) have increased consumer and retailer interaction and engagement, enabling customers to scan QR barcodes on their mobiles to gain direct access to the product website, marketing, competitions and product information. Smartphones provide contactless payment services using Near Field Communications (NFC) technology. This allows customers to make payments via in-store terminals making the payment process more convenient.

¹Verdict Research, "Retail Futures H1 2011 - e-Retail", March 2011

²Verdict Research, "How Britain Shops: Overall 2011", March 2011

³Verdict Research, "UK e-Retail 2011", May 2011

-
- 2.9 Retailers have and continue to develop 'augmented reality' technology which will merge the physical and virtual worlds to allow retailers (such as Ikea and Tesco) to provide an interactive view of how products such as televisions or furniture, will look in consumers own homes or provide 3D projections of life size products.
- 2.10 Fashion retailers including Net-a-Porter and Clarks for example already use augmented reality technology through pointing smartphones and tablets at an image or advertisement which triggers video content on the mobile device. This technology brings static adverts to life and allows consumers to view catwalk runways, video advertisements and product information, and to make purchases. Augmented reality will provide an interactive advertising platform for retailers, who will use this technology to break down the barriers between online and in-store shopping.
- 2.11 While the Internet and new technologies pose challenges to the high street, retailers are constantly looking for ways to exploit the trading opportunities available through offering a multichannel shopping experience. The advantages offered by physical stores, in terms of the experience and immediacy of products, will see a network of key stores remain a fundamental component of retailers' strategies to develop a more coherent and integrated multichannel proposition.

SALES EFFICIENCY

- 2.12 An efficiency growth rate represents the ability of retailers to increase their productivity and absorb higher than inflation increases in their costs (such as rents, rates and service charges) by increasing their average sales densities. The application of a turnover 'efficiency' growth rate is a standard approach used in retail planning studies and is in accordance with good practice.
- 2.13 Although hard quantitative evidence is limited, comparison businesses in particular have, over time, increased sales densities by achieving improvements in productivity in the use of floorspace. Analysis of past data is difficult as sales densities increases have been affected by changes in the use of retail floorspace over the last 20 years, with higher value space-efficient electrical goods replacing lower value space intensive goods, the growth in out-of-centre retailing, a number of one-off events like Sunday-trading and longer opening hours and the very strong growth of retail expenditure relative to the growth in floorspace.
- 2.14 Following the recession many retailers have struggled to increase or even maintain sales density levels and, together with other financial problems, have led some retailers into
-

closure. With the expectation of weaker expenditure growth, sales density growth is also expected to be lower than previous estimates, unless retailers accelerate store closures and more existing retail stock is taken out of use.

- 2.15 Based on continuing trends towards more modern, higher density stores and the demolition of older inefficient space, Experian expect relatively constrained efficiency growth. The scope for sales density increases for convenience goods is more limited as expanding store portfolios will increasingly overlap with the catchment of existing stores and result in the cannibalisation of existing sales.

OPERATOR SPACE REQUIREMENTS

- 2.16 One of the major trends to emerge from the economic downturn has been the decline in the amount of retail space in town centre locations. This is, in part, a consequence of the harsh economic conditions forcing out independent retailers whose margins became too tight to survive and some multiples which have either collapsed or their store portfolios have shrunk after entering a pre-pack administration. These losses have not been offset by new developments, as many town centre schemes have been put on hold or revised downwards in scale. With online presence allowing national coverage, it is expected that retailers will remain cautious about expansion.
- 2.17 As retailers cut back on space to improve efficiencies and online becomes a more important channel, a new model is emerging in town centres. Retailers are moving towards opening larger flagship stores in strategic locations which are supported by smaller satellite stores and transactional websites. The larger flagships will accommodate the fuller range while smaller stores will offer a more select range supplemented by Internet kiosks allowing access to the wider range.
- 2.18 This model offers many advantages such as lower property costs, more efficient logistics and being able to open stores where there is a high level of demand despite there being space restrictions. Such models are already being trialled by retailers including Debenhams and House of Fraser. The first House of Fraser.com store, comprising just 140 sqm, opened at Hammerson's Union Square Shopping Centre, Aberdeen in October 2011, followed by a second in Liverpool in November 2011. It is reported that the retailer will open similar stores in locations with strong web sales, but without a store presence. Marks & Spencer is also trialling a boutique offer with sample ranges of clothing combined with online video and ordering capabilities.

OUT-OF-CENTRE PRESSURES

- 2.19 As retailers opt to develop stores in the most strategic and cost effective locations, there has been a notable resurgence to out-of-centre destinations which offer the benefit of lower rents, better space and in most cases, free parking. According to Verdict, out-of-town is the only channel which has seen store numbers increase consistently since 2000. BIS report that the number of out-of-centre stores has increased by up to c.1,800 (25%) since 2000; whilst the number of town centre stores fell by almost 15,000 between 2000 and 2009, the majority of which are likely to have been in 'high street' locations.
- 2.20 John Lewis for example, has developed a number of out-of-town stores through its At Home format. Reports suggest that the retailer is actively seeking to increase its out-of-town portfolio. Other retailers including H&M and Primark are also reported to be seeking to expand their portfolios in out-of-centre locations.

FOODSTORES

- 2.21 In the convenience sector, the 'race for floorspace' has significantly diminished with Tesco and latterly Sainsbury's downgrading their respective new store opening programmes in the short to medium term. The reduction in new store openings has been coupled with a move away from large stores towards the more traditional convenience orientated formats. The reduction in store sizes and realignment to predominantly convenience retail formats has been primarily driven by the increase in online sales of non-food retail goods.
- 2.22 Whilst there remains a significant development pipeline (Verdict estimate that between 2010 and 2015 the leading grocers will increase their space by 2 million sqm - almost double that of the new space opened between 2005 and 2010), the mainstream retailers are increasing being more selective in terms of future store opening locations and are no longer acquiring sites in order to restriction competition. Prime sites are now only being actively considered by the mainstream operators unless it is a 'once in a generation' opportunity to achieve representation in a long standing target area.
- 2.23 The continuing fall out of independents from the market will provide further opportunities for the expansion of the leading brands. Smaller store formats are becoming more of a focus as top up shopping is becoming increasingly popular – a response to consumers being discouraged from travelling long distances by high fuel prices and as more are

shopping online for staple goods. Following in the path of Tesco and Sainsbury's, Asda, Morrison's and Waitrose are all in the process of expanding smaller concept stores.

- 2.24 The (limited assortment) discount operators (Lidl and Aldi) are again embarking on a significant expansion programme (Lidl has announced plans to open a further 60 new stores in 2013). The proposed expansion programmes are based on the increasing market share which the discount operators are achieving from middle class shoppers who are price sensitive but retain a desire for quality produce. Discount operators are therefore increasingly seeking to increase representation in more affluent areas.

THE ROLE OF THE TOWN CENTRE

- 2.25 The town centre has been the main shopping channel for the last 30 years. However, its role is set to change dramatically. Emerging trends suggest that it will be used more for leisure and social activities with more bars, restaurants, food outlets and community spaces opening in vacant units. The recent announcement by the Government to enable temporary changes of use from Class A1 to Class A3 amongst others is likely to precipitate this trend where market demand arises.
- 2.26 These trends are of major importance to the main town centres in the borough which will need to adapt to this broader role by broadening their non-retail offer. Data from the Local Data Company indicates that town centres with more non-retail outlets have seen an improvement in their performance. Between 2009 and 2011, 114 towns improved their town centre score and reduced their vacancy rate and of these, 60.5% had a lower proportion of retail outlets.
- 2.27 As retailers improve their multi-channel offer, town centre stores will be used more to support e-retailing with click and collect points and safe drop boxes for customers to collect their online orders as well as satellite stores opening for customers to make online purchases. As demand for retail floorspace declines, it is anticipated that more secondary and tertiary space which suffers from lower levels of footfall, will increasingly be converted into residential uses.
- 2.28 In order to ensure that town centres have a viable function moving forwards, it will be important for the Council to aim to drive footfall to turn around their town centres and improve dwell time to increase awareness of offers and impulse purchases. This can be achieved by getting a better understanding of the catchment area and what local people want, improving the mix of retail and non-retail outlets in the centre to make them stay longer, and holding commercial, cultural and community events to create a 'unique

selling point' for the town centre to differentiate it from the competition and encourage people to visit. Councils will also need to promote the wider area, to encourage further investment in jobs, and in the town centre, to persuade residents to spend their money in the area and support the town further.

- 2.29 Smaller town centres have already been greatly impacted by the pull of larger, higher order shopping destinations, leading to a higher vacancy rate and weaker performance. For these centres, it will be increasingly important to create a differentiated offer, tailored to the local catchment and to encourage residents to shop and socialise more locally.

OVERALL SUMMARY

- 2.30 It is evident that the traditional high street faces a number of challenges not least from the tightening of retail spend and changing consumer behaviour but also from increasing competition posed by the Internet and out-of-centre developments. Whilst the future is uncertain, in light of the challenge currently faced, strategies which support the high street are considered ever more vital.
- 2.31 Whilst the town centre 'first' strategy must continue to prevail, strategies in some instances will need to adopt a degree of pragmatism and at worst consider the process of managing decline of some centres, particularly secondary ones, given the ongoing process of consolidation in the retail sector.

3. PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK

NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK (NPPF)

- 3.1 National Planning Policy Framework was adopted in late March 2012 and has replaced Planning Policy Statement 4: *Planning for Sustainable Economic Growth*. The PPS4 practice guidance on need, impact and sequential assessments does however remain as an informative tool for both plan making and development management functions.

TOWN CENTRE VITALITY AND VIABILITY

- 3.2 The NPPF (Section 2) specifies that planning policy should promote competitive town centre environments and set out policies for the management and growth of centres over the plan period. Local Planning Authorities (LPAs) are directed to:
- Recognise town centres as the heart of their communities and pursue policies to support their viability and vitality.
 - Define hierarchies and the extent of town centres and primary shopping areas.
 - Promote competitive town centres that provide customer choice and a diverse retail offer which reflects the individuality of town centres.
 - Retain and enhance existing markets, ensuring they remain attractive and competitive.
 - Allocate appropriate in-centre sites which are not compromised by limited site availability. If it is not possible to ensure a sufficient range of suitable sites, appropriate edge of centre sites that are well connected to a town centre should be allocated.
 - Where town centres are in decline, local authorities should plan positively for their futures and encourage economic activity.
- 3.3 The long-standing sequential test is retained in the NPPF albeit that there is increased emphasis on LPAs to ensure an available supply of sites.

EVIDENCE BASE REQUIREMENTS

- 3.4 Local Plans should be based on adequate, up-to-date and relevant evidence. In relation to planning to meet business requirements, LPAs are required to have a clear understanding of business needs within the economic markets operating in and across their area. LPAs are directed to use the evidence base to (amongst others):
- The needs for land or floorspace for economic development, including both the quantitative and qualitative needs for all foreseeable types of economic activity over the plan period, including for retail and leisure development.
 - The role and function of town centres and the relationship between them, including any trends in the performance of centres; and
 - The capacity of existing centres to accommodate new town centre development.
- 3.5 The NPPF constitutes a material consideration which LPAs should take into account from the date of publication (late March 2012).

NORTH EAST LINCOLNSHIRE LOCAL PLAN

- 3.6 The Local Plan was adopted in 2003 and a number of policies remain 'saved' until replaced by the emerging Local Plan. Given that this study is to inform future planning policy, a brief summary of the relevant adopted Local Plan policies is provided below:
- **POLICY S1** provides a hierarchy of shopping centres, permitting new shopping development at the following centres, providing they are consistent with their scale and function: **TIER 1 (SUB-REGIONAL CENTRE)**; Great Grimsby (incorporating Top Town and Freeman Street areas); **TIER 2 (TOWN CENTRES)**; Cleethorpes and Immingham; **TIER 3 (LOCAL CENTRES)**; and **TIER 4 (VILLAGE CENTRES)**
 - **POLICY S2** defines the borough's shopping areas.
 - **POLICY S4** defines primary shopping frontages and permits non-retail development at ground floor level, provided that the development would not result in more than 33% of the individual units being in non-retail use. With respect to Grimsby Top Town, retail uses within the defined primary frontages are defined as falling within Classes A1 – A3. However, within the defined primary frontages in Cleethorpes and Immingham, retail is defined solely as Class A1.

- **POLICY S6** defines out of town shopping areas in the borough and permits retail, financial & professional services and food & drink uses in these locations where the development will be limited to consolidation and diversification with compatible uses to help serve the needs of local communities. The policy justification text goes on to confirm that development will be confined to these defined areas.
- **POLICY S7** sets out permissible town centre uses within local centres.

4. FLOORSPACE SURVEYS

4.1 The NPPF states that comprehensive up-to-date monitoring of town centre performance is essential in enabling local planning authorities to improve the vitality and viability of town centres and effectively plan for the future. The floorspace composition of the main town centres in the borough has been defined utilising the following data sources:

- **EXPERIAN GOAD SURVEYS;** Experian has published floorspace plans and accompanying category reports for the main town centres in the borough. These reports and plans have been utilised to enable a comparative assessment of a centre against the regional (Yorkshire and Humberside) benchmarks from the Experian database.
- **GVA FLOORSPACE SURVEY UPDATES;** independent surveys have been completed given that Goad centre surveys are based on Experian's own interpretation of the true extent of retailing within a centre rather than the town centre (primary) shopping area boundaries as defined in the adopted Local Plan (policy S2). GVA has therefore undertaken its own floorspace survey based on adopted boundaries.

4.2 In terms of existing local centres, the Council has completed detailed survey work in 2012 as part of its wider Annual Monitoring Report (AMR) requirement; we have therefore not surveyed local centres as part of this study.

GRIMSBY (TOP TOWN)

EXPERIAN GOAD FLOORSPACE SURVEY

4.3 The latest Experian Goad survey of Top Town was completed in April 2012; the extent of the survey area covered by Goad is highlighted on the plan at **Appendix 4**. The results of the Experian Goad survey are summarised below; the average for comparable centres in the Yorkshire and Humberside region is also provided to enable comparative analysis.

Retail Sector	No. Outlets	% Outlets		Floorspace (sqm)	% Floorspace	
		Victoria Street	Yorkshire & Humberside		Victoria Street	Yorkshire & Humberside
Convenience	19	5.99	8.72	6,633	8.9	18.81
Comparison	149	47	42.11	45,578	61.13	46.74
Retail Service	30	9.46	11.49	2,499	3.35	5.11
Leisure Service	36	11.36	15.22	5,472	7.34	10.56
Financial Service	42	13.26	9.52	8,612	11.55	8.05
Vacant	41	12.93	12.94	5,769	7.74	10.74
TOTAL	317	100	100	74,563	100	100

4.4 The main headline findings arising from the latest Goad data is as follows:

- **CONVENIENCE**; the town centre convenience retail offer is below the Goad regional average in terms of both floorspace and number of outlets. This reflects the overall limitations of the town centre in terms of its current provision of convenience floorspace. The town centre retail offer is predominantly orientated towards sub-regional comparison shopping.
- **COMPARISON**; the number of outlets and overall proportion of floorspace within the town centre dedicated to comparison retailing is above the Goad regional averages. This reflects the predominant comparison shopping function and the fact that the majority of the town centre comprises the purpose-built Freshney Place covered shopping centre.
- **VACANT**; whilst the number of vacant units within the town centre is comparable to the Goad regional average, the quantum of floorspace is significantly below. This suggests that the existing vacant units within the town centre are relatively small units.

4.5 Overall, the Goad survey indicates that the town centre, as of April 2012, was relatively viable in comparative terms with a strong comparison retail offer. The low level of vacancies in floorspace terms is also extremely positive and potentially reflects the wider impacts of the current economic climate on smaller retailers rather than any specific 'structural' deficiency in terms of the town centre composition, both in terms of retailers and spatially.

COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT (2005 STUDY)

- 4.6 The town centre floorspace survey which informed the 2005 Study was based on an Experian Goad report from November 2003. The study set out the retail composition of the centre on the basis of the number of units⁴, as follows:

Retail Sector	No. Outlets	% Outlets	
		Victoria Street	National
Convenience	20	6.08	9.20
Comparison	174	52.89	47.97
Service	98	29.79	31.16
Vacant	33	10.03	10.29
TOTAL	317		

- 4.7 In comparative terms, the main changes between the 2003 and 2012 Goad reports are as follows:

- **CONVENIENCE**; the number of units within the town centre has remained relatively constant since 2003 with only the loss of one unit.
- **COMPARISON**; the number of units has significantly decreased since 2003 from 174 to 149; this may in part reflect the current adverse economic conditions which has precipitated the closure of several national multiple and local independent comparison retailers.
- **VACANT**; the number of vacant units within the town centre has increased from 33 to 41; this is likely to reflect the current economic conditions.

- 4.8 Additionally, the 2005 Study confirmed the quantum of vacant floorspace in the town centre to be c. 6,040 m² when the Goad report was completed (2003). This is broadly similar to the 2012 Goad figure of 5,769 m² and may point to several units being vacant for long period of time.

⁴ Table excludes Miscellaneous floorspace which was referenced in the 2005 Study for comparability purposes

GVA FLOORSPACE SURVEY UPDATE (MAY 2013)

- 4.9 As detailed in the introduction, the Goad survey is based on its interpretation of the true extent of retailing within a centre rather than the town centre shopping area boundaries as defined in the adopted Local Plan under policy S2.
- 4.10 GVA has therefore updated the Goad figures to remove all floorspace located beyond these defined town centre boundaries. However, a review of the Experian GOAD database identifies that the survey only includes gross floorspace relating to an individual building footprint rather than including the number of trading floors. The exclusion of upper trading floorspace therefore results in an under-estimation of floorspace in the town centre. Therefore, the upper trading floors within the Freshney Place Shopping Centre have been included within the GVA survey.
- 4.11 The updated figures are therefore summarised below and underpin the quantitative capacity assessment.

Retail Sector	Floorspace (sqm gross)	Units
Convenience	2,189	12
Comparison	53,960	122
Service ⁵	28,731	168
Vacant	8,770	54
TOTAL	79,184	355

- 4.12 The main differences between the Goad and the GVA update are as follows:
- **CONVENIENCE**; the GVA floorspace survey is significantly below the Goad estimate due to the exclusion of the market hall from the survey update. The market hall (4,260 m²) was excluded given that it is not solely convenience-based and has a mix of retail uses which would be difficult to robustly apportion into floorspace areas. If the market was included in the GVA assessment then the decrease in convenience floorspace would be around 184 m².
 - **COMPARISON**; the number of outlets dedicated to comparison retail in the defined town centre shopping area is 28 less than the Goad survey identified. There is however a significant increase in Class A1 comparison retail floorspace between the two surveys due to the inclusion of upper trading floors within Freshney Place.

⁵ Services comprise Retail Services (Class A1), Professional (Class A2), Food & Drink (Classes A3 – A5) and Other Services.

- **VACANT**; there are a total of 54 units within the defined town centre shopping area which are currently vacant; this is 13 more than the 2012 Goad survey. The quantum of vacant floorspace has also increased significantly from 5,769 m² to 8,770 m².

4.13 Overall, the GVA floorspace survey identifies significant differences in floorspace composition, particularly for comparison retail and vacancies in comparison to the 2012 Goad survey.

EDGE-OF-CENTRE / OUT-OF-CENTRE RETAIL PROVISION

4.14 The town centre is physically constrained by surrounding residential to the west, the railway line to the south (acts as physical barrier) and the docks area to the north. There has consequently been significant edge and out-of-centre retail development around Grimsby town centre.

4.15 The main full-range foodstores in the town, the large free-standing Sainsbury's and Tesco Extra stores, are located either side of Corporation Bridge to the north of the town centre; whilst the Asda store is located within the Freeman Street area, it effectively also performs an out-of-centre function relative to Grimsby (Top Town) town centre. Further distant from the town centre is a small Asda supermarket (former Netto) on Corporation Road (close to Alexandra Retail Park) and a full-range Morrison's store to the south west in Laceby; this store serves the western extent of the town and car-borne residents in both Immingham and Cleethorpes.

4.16 In comparison retail terms, opposite the Sainsbury's store is Alexandra Retail Park which is predominantly bulky retail orientated with occupiers such as Wickes DIY, Pets at Home, Argos and ScS; there is however a large Matalan store which sells an extensive range of clothing and homeware.

4.17 To the north of the Tesco Extra store is Victoria Retail Park which comprises a mix of retail warehouses including Curry's, Next, Dunelm, Carpetright and Homebase DIY. Further south and to the east of the town centre beyond the railway line at Peakes Parkway is a large B&Q warehouse and Halfords store.

GRIMSBY (FREEMAN STREET)

EXPERIAN GOAD FLOORSPACE SURVEY

- 4.18 The most recent Experian GOAD survey of Freeman Street was completed in April 2012; the physical extent of the Goad survey is shown on the plan at **Appendix 4**. The main Goad survey results are as follows:

Retail Sector	No. Outlets	% Outlets		Floorspace (sqm)	% Floorspace	
		Freeman Street	Yorkshire & Humberside		Freeman Street	Yorkshire & Humberside
Convenience	19	7.45	8.72	17,419	26.08	18.81
Comparison	88	34.51	42.11	19,900	29.79	46.74
Retail Service	13	5.1	11.49	4,125	6.17	5.11
Leisure Service	19	7.45	15.22	2,954	4.42	10.56
Financial Service	20	7.85	9.52	3,772	5.64	8.05
Vacant	96	37.65	12.94	18,627	27.89	10.74
TOTAL	255	100	100	66,797	100	100

- 4.19 The survey results highlight the following:

- **CONVENIENCE**; whilst the number of units dedicated to convenience retailing is slightly below the Goad regional average, the quantum of floorspace is significantly above the average. This reflects the predominant convenience orientated offer at Freeman Street and the presence of a large free-standing Asda store on the southern extent of the defined shopping area.
- **COMPARISON**; the number of outlets and proportion of floorspace within the town centre dedicated to comparison retailing is significantly below the Goad regional average in both instance. This reflects the current limitations of the retail offer.

VACANT; the number of vacant outlets and overall quantum of vacant floorspace are significantly higher than the Goad regional average. The significantly higher than (regional) average vacancy rates are likely to reflect a number of national and local economic factors including the ongoing adverse economic climate and the presence of traditional retail stock which are in some instances becoming increasingly obsolete in commercial terms (demand etc.).

- 4.20 The significant number of vacancies along Freeman Street does however also reflect a 'point in assessment' whereby ongoing regeneration initiatives in the area, including comprehensive intervention and redevelopment for alternative uses such as residential, have yet to be realised. The rationalisation of the existing area into a coherent retail centre is however considered later in the report.

COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT (2005 STUDY)

- 4.21 The 2005 Study reported the composition of the Freeman Street area on the basis of an Experian Goad report from November 2003, as follows:

Retail Sector	No. Outlets	% Outlets	
		Freeman Street	National
Convenience	18	6.74	9.20
Comparison	115	43.07	47.97
Service	47	17.60	31.16
Vacant	84	10.29	10.29
TOTAL	264		

- 4.22 In comparative terms, the changes in the Goad survey results between 2003 and 2012 are as follows:

- **CONVENIENCE**; the number of outlets has remained the same (1 unit more in 2012); this is with the closure of the Netto store on Duncombe Street following the company's acquisition by Asda.
- **COMPARISON**; the number of comparison retail outlets has significantly decreased from 115 to 88 in 2012.
- **VACANT**; the number of vacant units has increased from 84 to 96 in 2012.

- 4.23 The survey results indicate the comparative decline in the performance and attractiveness of Freeman Street as a viable retail destination has continued to fall since the 2005 Study (and as identified in the 1994 Study before that).

GVA FLOORSPACE SURVEY UPDATE (MAY 2013)

- 4.24 GVA has completed a new floorspace survey (**Appendix 4**) based on the defined shopping area boundaries; the results are as follows:

Retail Sector	Floorspace (sqm gross)	Units
Convenience	15,709	15
Comparison	15,839	71
Service	7,719	53
Vacant	17,824	105
TOTAL	57,091	244

4.25 Comparative analysis of the floorspace survey results identifies the following:

- **CONVENIENCE**; whilst there is a difference of four units between the GVA and Goad surveys, there is a significant difference in floorspace (1,710 m²). This may be attributable to the closure of some convenience units since 2012 or the fact that the Goad survey extends a significant distance to the south to Pasture Road (outside of adopted retail boundaries). The number of units in convenience use identified in the GVA survey is 4 less than Goad.
- **COMPARISON**; there is a significant difference in the quantum of floorspace identified between both surveys. The Goad survey identifies c. 19,900 m² of comparison floorspace whereas the GVA survey only identifies c. 15,800 m²). The differences are due to changes in representation (e.g. recent vacancy of Rayners Department store which has a large floorplate) and the area surveyed (Goad survey extends significant distance beyond adopted boundaries). The Goad survey identifies 88 units in comparison use whereas the GVA survey identifies 71; this is again attributable to survey area and changes in representation since 2012.
- **VACANT**; whilst the GVA survey concentrates on a smaller area based on the adopted retail area boundaries, the number of units currently vacant is more than the Goad survey (105 to 96). The quantum of vacant floorspace identified in the GVA survey is however less than the Goad survey (c. 17,800 m² compared to c. 18,600 m²).

4.26 Overall, there continues to be significant (structural) changes in retailer representation and thereafter overall performance of Freeman Street as a viable retail destination. Whilst the Asda store performs a strong anchor function for the southern part of the Freeman Street area, the northern part is relatively isolated and is increasingly becoming redundant in retail (and physical) terms. There is an edge-of-centre Aldi to the north but

the store is physically separated from the town centre and predominantly caters for drive-by trade given its prominent location on Cleethorpes Road.

EDGE-OF-CENTRE / OUT-OF-CENTRE RETAIL PROVISION

- 4.27 Freeman Street forms part of the Great Grimsby centre; the edge and out-of-centre provision is summarised in the previous Top Town (Victoria Street) analysis.

CLEETHORPES

EXPERIAN GOAD FLOORSPEACE SURVEY

- 4.28 The latest GOAD survey of Cleethorpes was undertaken in September 2012; the Goad survey area is identified on the town centre plan at **Appendix 4**. The survey results against the Yorkshire and Humberside regional average is provided below for comparison.

Retail Sector	No. Outlets	% Outlets		Floorspace (sqm)	% Floorspace	
		Cleethorpes	Yorkshire & Humberside		Cleethorpes	Yorkshire & Humberside
Convenience	14	10.37	8.72	2,239	12.71	18.81
Comparison	48	35.56	42.11	6,178	35.07	46.74
Retail Service	14	10.37	11.49	1,375	7.81	5.11
Leisure Service	36	26.67	15.22	4,794	27.22	10.56
Financial Service	11	8.14	9.52	1,626	9.22	8.05
Vacant	12	8.89	12.94	1,403	7.96	10.74
TOTAL	135	100	100	17,615	100	100

- 4.29 The Goad survey results indicate the following:

- **CONVENIENCE**; whilst the number of outlets within the town centre is slightly above the Goad regional average, the quantum of floorspace is much lower; this reflects the predominance of smaller format convenience outlets (small Co-Op and Sainsbury's Local stores in addition to local independents) in the town centre.
- **COMPARISON**; the number of units and quantum of floorspace dedicated to comparison retailing is significantly below the Goad regional average. The existing comparison retail provision in the town centre is relatively small-scale and predominantly orientated to meeting daily 'top-up' shopping needs.

- **VACANT**; both the number of vacant units and overall quantum of vacant floorspace are below the Goad regional average.

4.30 Overall, the survey results show that, notwithstanding the limited convenience and comparison retail offer, the town centre is a viable destination with low vacancy levels.

COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT (2005 STUDY)

4.31 The 2005 Study was informed by an Experian Goad report from August 2004 which set out the following floorspace composition:

Retail Sector	No. Outlets	% Outlets	
		Cleethorpe	National
Convenience	17	12.14	9.20
Comparison	52	37.14	47.97
Service	54	38.57	31.16
Vacant	15	10.71	10.29
TOTAL	138		

4.32 In headline terms, the main changes between the two Goad surveys are as follows:

- **CONVENIENCE**; the number of outlets has decreased from 17 to 14 in 2012.
- **COMPARISON**; the number of outlets has decreased from 52 to 48 in 2012.
- **VACANT**; the number of vacancies has decreased from 15 to 12. The quantum of floorspace vacant has however remained similar (1,403 m² compared to 1,394 m²).

4.33 The respective decreases in floorspace has been partially off-set by the significant increase in service outlets in the town which have increased from 54 in 2004 to 61; this change in floorspace composition may in part be attributable to the ongoing economic climate and the opening of new service uses such as Bookmakers (Class A2 use).

GVA FLOORSPACE SURVEY UPDATE (MAY 2013)

- 4.34 GVA has completed a new floorspace survey based on the existing defined shopping area for the town centre. The survey results are summarised below.

Retail Sector	Floorspace (sqm gross)	Units
Convenience	1,867	11
Comparison	6,256	41
Service	10,718	88
Vacant	1,314	3
TOTAL⁶	20,155	143

- 4.35 Comparative analysis of the floorspace survey results against the Experian Goad survey highlights the following:

- **CONVENIENCE**; the number of units identified by the GVA survey is 3 less than the Goad survey and this is reflected in the difference in floorspace with the Goad survey identifying c. 300 m² more. This difference reflects a small number of changes of use and vacancies.
- **COMPARISON**; there are less comparison retail units identified under the GVA survey (41 whereas Goad identified 48). The quantum of comparison retail floorspace identified by the GVA survey is however broadly the same as Goad (c. 6,200 m²).
- **VACANT**; the GVA survey identifies significantly less vacant units (3) compared to the Goad survey (12). The quantum of vacant floorspace is broadly similar (1,403 m² to 1,314 m²) suggesting the potential re-letting of smaller units.

- 4.36 The vitality and viability of the town centre is further reinforced by the fact that there are only three vacant units within the defined shopping area.

EDGE-OF-CENTRE / OUT-OF-CENTRE RETAIL PROVISION

- 4.37 The town centre retail offer is limited and is predominantly orientated towards daily convenience and comparison shopping needs. The main full-range convenience store destination in the Cleethorpes area is the large out-of-centre Tesco Extra store at Hewitt's Circus to the west of the town; the store is a significant distance from the town centre and

⁶ Excludes floorspace defined as miscellaneous

there are limited linkages between both. There are also Poundstretcher and Pets@Home units adjacent to the Tesco store.

- 4.38 Meridian Point Retail and Leisure Park, which is located to the south of the town centre, has a Factory Shop and Leading Labels Shop. The park is a significant distance from the town centre with limited linkages between both.

IMMINGHAM

- 4.39 There are no Goad survey plans available for Immingham and no specific floorspace assessment was completed as part of the 2005 Study. GVA has therefore completed its own survey of the defined town centre shopping area (**Appendix 4**). The survey results are as follows:

Retail Sector	Floorspace (sqm gross)	Units
Convenience	2,839	7
Comparison	2,519	7
Service	852	8
Vacant	2,500	18
TOTAL	8,710	40

- 4.40 The survey results highlight a significantly high quantum of vacant floorspace; this is however reflective of the ongoing regeneration plans for the centre which include substantial demolition and remodelling so as to accommodate a Tesco foodstore.

EDGE-OF-CENTRE / OUT-OF-CENTRE RETAIL PROVISION

- 4.41 The town centre predominantly comprises a post war, purpose-built shopping parade. There are however edge-of-centre Co-Op (with Peacock's clothing concession) and Farmfoods stores to the north of Washdyke Lane. There is no out-of-centre provision in the town aside from a small Sainsbury's Local serving top-up food shopping needs.

5. RETAIL CAPACITY METHODOLOGY

- 5.1 The quantitative assessment adopts a conventional step-by-step methodology, drawing upon the results of the household telephone survey to understand existing shopping patterns and to model existing flows of available expenditure to the main retail destinations within the borough and the wider sub-region (extending into the adjoining North Lincolnshire local authority area).
- 5.2 Having established the baseline position, the quantitative capacity modelling exercise goes on to establish the performance of the main centres in the borough, the main stores and retail park destinations. The methodology, data inputs and assumptions adopted in the assessment exercise are set out below.

1) STUDY AREA DEFINITION

- 5.3 In order to enable a comparative assessment of the survey results in terms of market share performance to be completed, the same study area and individual catchment zones as adopted for the 2005 Study have been maintained. The only change to the survey areas has been the extension of the Louth catchment (survey zone 6) to include the postcodes (LN11 8/9) covering the town centre; this change has been made to better pick up sub-regional comparison shopping flows into Grimsby.
- 5.4 The updated catchment plan is provided at **Appendix 1** for reference. All catchment zones are defined on the basis of individual postcode sectors, so as to generate population and expenditure data from the *Experian Micromarketer* system (derived from ONS mid-year estimates)⁷.

2) HOUSEHOLD TELEPHONE SURVEY

- 5.5 A total of **900 household surveys** have been completed across zones 1 to 9, covering North East Lincolnshire, as well as the outer zones; this is above the 750 surveys completed as part of the 2005 Study. A minimum survey sample of 100 surveys per catchment zone has been achieved in accordance with recommended PPS4 practice guidance (Appendix B).

- 5.6 The survey has been designed to establish household shopping habits in terms of convenience (main food / top-up) and comparison goods expenditure. The results of the two types of food shopping questions are merged through the application of a weighting (75% main food; 25% top-up food shopping split), which reflects the estimated proportion of expenditure accounted for main (bulk) and daily top-up food shopping. This produces a composite pattern of convenience spending, enabling the identification of each main centre and foodstore market share.
- 5.7 With regards to comparison goods, additional questions have been included in the current survey so as to pick up finer grain understanding of local residents shopping patterns for particular individual goods; the changes in question scope are as follows:

2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
Clothing, Footwear and Other Fashion Goods	Clothing, Footwear and Other Fashion Goods
Furniture, Floor Coverings and Household Textiles	Furniture, Floor Coverings and Household Textiles
DIY and Decorating Goods	DIY and Decorating Goods
Large Domestic Appliances (incl. Washing Machines, Fridges and Cookers)	Major Household Appliances (incl. Washing Machines, Fridges and Cookers)
Small Electrical Appliances, IT Equipment, TVs and DVD/CD Players	Large Electrical Goods (incl. TV, Hi-Fi, Radio, Photographic and Computer Equipment)
Personal and Luxury Goods (incl. Books, Jewellery, China, Glass and Cosmetics)	Personal Goods (i.e. Jewellery, Watches and Other Personal Effects)
Recreational Goods (incl. Bicycles, Games, Toys, Sport and Camping Equipment)	Recreational Goods (i.e. Bicycles, Games, Toys, Sports Equipment, Musical Instruments)
	Books and Stationary Items
	Medical Goods, Therapeutic Appliances and Other Pharmaceutical Products (excl. Prescriptions)
	Glassware, Tableware and Household Hardware Goods (Utensils)
	CDs / DVDs and Computer Games
	Small Domestic Appliances (incl. Personal Care Appliances and Small Electrical Goods including Kettles, Irons, Toasters and Hairdryers)
	Garden Products and Pet-Related Products

- 5.8 The household survey results have been weighted in order to take account of the resident population in each respective zone to ensure a representative response. The results of all these questions were merged using weighting to reflect the amount of per capita expenditure in the survey zones for each of the different categories of goods.

⁷ Experian Retail Planner 10.1, September 2012

- 5.9 In addition, the household survey also sought to understand where people presently go to pursue their main leisure activities (cinema, eating out etc.). The survey also sought to determine customer / visitor profile, mode of travel, the attraction and a number of attitudinal questions determining what users think about the retail and leisure offer, environmental quality and perception of safety.

3) DATA VARIABLES

i) BASELINE POPULATION ESTIMATES

- 5.10 The population estimates and forecasts for each of the survey zones are derived from the *Experian Micromarketer* database (2011 Price Base). The population estimates are based on trend-line projections from the 2001 Census results and are calibrated to Local Authority District targets on the most recently available Government household and population data (ONS 2011-based projections).
- 5.11 The differences between the 2005 and 2013 population projections (baseline ONS derived from Experian) for the catchment areas in the borough, are as follows (2011 date used as comparable for both studies):

Catchment	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
ZONE 1 - GRIMSBY	39,659	44,447
ZONE 2 - NW GRIMSBY	52,306	55,147
ZONE 3 - CLEETHORPES	29,998	32,740
ZONE 4 - IMMINGHAM	15,888	16,382
ZONE 5 - RURAL SOUTH	19,532	19,322

- 5.12 The results show that the baseline population in the Grimsby and Cleethorpes catchments in particular (survey zones 1 – 3) are considerably above the 2005 Study projections. There has been limited change in the projections for the remaining two zones.

ii) STRATEGIC HOUSING GROWTH

- 5.13 A Strategic Housing Market Assessment (SHMA) has been completed as part of the emerging Local Plan evidence base. Whilst ordinarily the emerging evidence base should seek to adopt a common ('aligned') population source, Experian (ONS trend-line) projections have been utilised for the retail study given that there is a fundamental

difference in the composition and geographical extent of the catchment areas defined for the respective studies.

- 5.14 The SHMA is aligned with the defined LPA boundary whereas the retail study adopts catchment geographies which are derived from individual postcode sectors. Therefore, whilst the survey zones (1 -5) broadly reflects the geographical extent of the borough, there are additional residential areas within the Immingham (survey zone 4) and Rural South (survey zone 5) catchments which are within adjoining local authority areas.
- 5.15 This difference in geographical composition subsequently impacts on the local population base and thereafter forward projections. As a result, the population projections used in the SHMA and the retail study are not directly comparable; the retail study base population for 2011 is c. 168,000 whereas the Census 2011 population for North East Lincolnshire of approximately 159,600.
- 5.16 The use of postcode specific catchment zones within the retail study is therefore something that is not replicated by the derivation of 'sub' local authority areas in the SHMA. Therefore, the robustness of seeking to align the respective evidence bases would be questionable.
- 5.17 In broad comparative terms, the Experian (ONS-based) population projections within survey zones 1 to 5, which broadly reflect the LPA boundaries, are projected to rise by 7,439 persons over the emerging Local Plan period to 2030; this is broadly mid-range between the following SHMA modelling scenarios:
- **Rebased Sub National Population Projection (SNPP) 2010 Scenario** - this scenario starts by using 2011 Census data on the population size and the number of households in the year 2011. Thereafter it applies the forecast changes to this base population consistent with the 2010 SNPP. Under this scenario the population is projected to grow by 3,460 persons over the period 2011 to 2030.
 - **Employment Led Scenario** - this scenario takes the Rebased SNPP 2010 and makes adjustments to the population based on the size of the labour force required to serve the level of forecast job growth. This assumes that commuting rates and unemployment rates are held constant over the period. This scenario forecasts a population growth of 13,484 and as previously noted is built upon the assumption that the local authority achieves 100% of the employment forecast.

- 5.18 The baseline Experian (ONS) based projections adopted for the retail study is broadly mid-way between the rebased SNPP and Employment-Led scenarios; the natural change scenario has been discounted due to its purely theoretical basis.
- 5.19 The SHMA projections are currently being updated to reflect recent changes to the methodology; a further scenario is also under consideration based upon a revised REM which is being adjusted to address the specific potential and nature of the local economy. Therefore, on the basis of the above, the Experian (ONS) projections are an appropriate baseline to underpin the quantitative retail assessment.

iii) AVAILABLE EXPENDITURE

EXPENDITURE PER CAPITA

- 5.20 The latest *Experian Micromarketer* data (Briefing Note 10.1, September 2012) was used to provide estimates of per capita (person) expenditure on convenience and comparison goods in 2011 prices; a comparison with the 2005 Study projections for the same year (2011) are set out below.

	CONVENIENCE		COMPARISON	
Catchment	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
ZONE 1 - GRIMSBY	£1,497	£1,559	£2,862	£1,921
ZONE 2 - NW GRIMSBY	£1,497	£1,659	£2,862	£2,203
ZONE 3 - CLEETHORPES	£1,497	£1,747	£2,862	£2,484
ZONE 4 - IMMINGHAM	£1,497	£1,728	£2,862	£2,374
ZONE 5 - RURAL SOUTH	£1,497	£1,894	£2,862	£2,685

- 5.21 The current spend per head figures for convenience is significantly above the 2005 Study whereas the comparison figures are substantially below. This partially reflects the ongoing adverse economic climate.

EXPENDITURE GROWTH RATES

- 5.22 The 2005 Study adopted a standard 0.7% per annum (p.a.) growth rate for convenience and 4.3% p.a. for comparison in the period between 2003 and 2021. The current Experian expenditure growth projections are however significantly lower until the latter phase of the emerging Local Plan (post 2018) when Experian adopt historic longer-term projections, as follows:

CONVENIENCE	0.1% (2011-2012)	-0.1% (2012-2013)	0.5% p.a. (2013-2018)	0.8% p.a. 2018 – 2030
COMPARISON	1.4% (2012)	1.8% (2013)	2.8% p.a. (2013-18)	2.9% p.a. (2018-23)

- 5.23 Whilst Experian projects that expenditure growth will return to historic levels in the longer term, there is extremely limited growth projected in the short term which reflects the current squeeze on household incomes and living standards. There is a significantly reduced amount of available comparison expenditure in the short term and allied to slower growth projections have implications for forward quantitative capacity as will be highlighted later in the report.

SPECIAL FORMS OF TRADING

- 5.24 The 2005 Study adopted a standard deduction of 1.85% for convenience goods and 7.71% for comparison goods. The latest Experian projections of special forms of trading (e.g. expenditure not available to spend in the shops - primarily internet sales⁸), is projected to rise towards the latter end of the plan period, as follows:

CONVENIENCE SFT DEDUCTIONS	2% (2012)	3.4% (2018)	4.6% (2028)
COMPARISON SFT DEDUCTIONS	9.9% (2012)	12.9% (2013-18)	16% (2023-28)

- 5.25 The deductions for convenience spend are relatively similar in the short term to the projections adopted in the 2005 Study and it is clear that there has been significant growth in comparison (non-food) spend deductions between the respective studies.
- 5.26 It should however be noted that the current Experian projections identify that longer-term growth in non-store (i.e. internet) based sales, particularly for convenience goods, are less strong than historically predicted due to current logistical difficulties in servicing customer demand on line (main retailers are beginning to open 'dark' stores to meet demand).
- 5.27 As previously detailed in the retail trends chapter, the overall trend for less expenditure being physically available to spend in traditional centres / stores poses significant challenges to traditional 'bricks and mortar' retailing and town centres as a whole.

⁸ Experian define SFTs as expenditure that does not take place in shops, such as that via mail order houses, door to door salesmen and stalls and markets. It also includes spending using digital TV and over the Internet.

iv) AVAILABLE EXPENDITURE CAPACITY

- 5.28 Taking account of the latest population and expenditure figures, allied to growth rates and relevant deductions, a comparison between the 2005 Study and the 2013 Study identifies the following differences in available expenditure capacity across the survey zones in the borough.

	CONVENIENCE		COMPARISON	
Catchment	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
ZONE 1 - GRIMSBY	£59.4m	£69.3m	£113.5m	£88.2m
ZONE 2 - NW GRIMSBY	£78.3m	£91.5m	£149.7m	£124.8m
ZONE 3 - CLEETHORPES	£44.9m	£57.2m	£85.8m	£82.6m
ZONE 4 - IMMINGHAM	£23.8m	£28.3m	£45.5m	£39.9m
ZONE 5 – RURAL SOUTH	£29.2m	£36.6m	£55.9m	£52.1m

- 5.29 As the table highlights, there is significantly more convenience spend available in each catchment zone compared to the 2005 Study projections. The comparison spend capacity however is significantly less; this is attributable to lower projected growth, less expenditure available to physically spend in shops due to increased non-store (internet) sales and the fact that there is less available spend due to the ongoing adverse economic climate.

TOURIST INFLOW

- 5.30 The total turnover of retail facilities in a particular settlement comprises expenditure from local (study area) residents plus expenditure flowing into the study area from other sources such as tourists; North East Lincolnshire and particularly the Cleethorpes area is a major tourist destination.
- 5.31 The Council commissioned a 2012 STEAM report⁹ which quantifies the local economic impact of tourism. The STEAM report sets out the following estimates of tourist expenditure on shopping goods in the Cleethorpes and Grimsby areas in 2011 (as per Table 9, Appendix 2b):

⁹ Scarborough Tourism Economic Activity Monitor

Catchment	OVERALL TOTAL	CONVENIENCE	COMPARISON
GRIMSBY	£60.3m	£22.3m	£38.0m
CLEETHORPES	£44.5m	£16.5m	£28.0m

- 5.32 In order that this total expenditure can be used as an input into individual estimates of convenience and comparison floorspace capacity, we have sub-divided it into separate totals (on the assumption that tourists spend similar proportions of their total retail expenditure on convenience and comparison shopping as local residents). The overall quantum of expenditure is based on a 37/63 convenience to comparison split.
- 5.33 Having established the convenience and comparison expenditure generated by tourists, the expenditure is projected forward in accordance with the growth rates set out previously in this chapter (i.e. assuming tourist expenditure grows on the same basis as local resident expenditure).
- 5.34 In applying the tourist expenditure to the quantitative capacity modelling exercise, given that the STEAM report only identifies Grimsby and Cleethorpes as broad shopping locations rather than specify the amount of expenditure spent at individual shopping destinations (i.e. town centre, foodstores or retail parks), the expenditure figures identified are applied to the respective overall centre assessments (i.e. town centre, edge and out-of-centre provision combined) rather than being apportioned to an individual destination.
- 5.35 The impact of tourist inflow on the capacity need projections for Grimsby and Cleethorpes is highlighted in blue in the quantitative tables at Appendix 2c and 3c¹⁰.

STORE PERFORMANCE

BENCHMARK TURNOVERS

- 5.36 In order to review the current turnover performance of the main centres as retail destinations and its main stores (particularly larger format foodstores), published benchmark performance s (estimates of trading at company average levels) has been compared against the survey-derived turnover figures identified in the capacity

modelling assessment. The company benchmark (turnover) has been calculated from average sales density figures obtained from *Mintel Retail Rankings* and *Verdict*.

SALES DENSITY IMPROVEMENTS (TRADING EFFICIENCY)

- 5.37 The 2005 Study adopted a standard 0% p.a. sales efficiency growth rate for convenience and 2.5% p.a. for comparison. The current Experian sales density projections set out below are relatively static in the medium term due to the current economic conditions:

CONVENIENCE SALES DENSITY	-0.7% (2012-13)	0.1% p.a. (2013-18)	0.2% p.a. (2018-2030)
COMPARISON SALES DENSITY	1.2% (2012-13)	2.1% p.a. (2013-18)	1.8% p.a. (2018-30)

4) CAPACITY REVIEW

- 5.38 The quantitative capacity is presented on strategic dates according with the lifespan of the new Local Plan to 2030. Having established the baseline capacity position, the assessment then goes on to consider what may be achievable in terms of potential increases in market share and thus quantitative capacity.
- 5.39 It should be noted that the potential uplift in expenditure only represents actual capacity if retail proposals and operators that emerge can genuinely qualitatively add to the existing retail offer of a town centre by strengthening its attractiveness so as to achieve the envisaged improvements in market share.
- 5.40 Any market share enhancement assessment should be viewed against the positive planning policy framework provided by NPPF. Therefore, should proposals emerge for the development of new retail facilities within the primary shopping area of the town centre then the application should be considered on its merits.
- 5.41 In the same respect, there is no NPPF based policy support for the diversion of trade from sequentially preferable central locations to new provision which is outside of a centre and is likely to lead to the loss of trade and wider benefits including linked shopping trips and footfall within a centre.

¹⁰ The impact of tourist inflow is shown in Tables 10d-e (Grimsby Overall) and Tables 11c and 11e (Cleethorpes Overall) of Appendix 2c for convenience capacity and Tables 22c and 24e of Appendix 3c for comparison capacity.

5) COMMITMENTS

- 5.42 In assessing the quantitative and qualitative needs for new provision in the primary town centres, it is important to understand existing committed and emerging proposals which could materially influence future performance and thereafter forward strategy. The only main convenience commitment in the borough is a new full-range Tesco store in Immingham as part of the wider planned town centre redevelopment.

Store	Zone	Gross Floorspace (sqm)	Net Floorspace (sqm)	Net Convenience (sqm) ¹¹	Status
APP DC/584/089/IMM – Proposed Class A1 TESCO Foodstore	Zone 4 - Immingham	4,274	2,975	2,082	PLANNING PERMISSION

- 5.43 In confirming existing commitments or emerging proposals outside of the borough, the Council has consulted with relevant adjoining local authorities. The only main convenience commitment likely to change identified main food shopping patterns in the wider sub-regional catchment is as follows:

Store	Zone	Gross Floorspace (sqm)	Net Floorspace (sqm)	Net Convenience (sqm)	Status
APP PA/2010/1415 - Proposed Class A1 TESCO	Zone 8 - Brigg	4,075	1,880	-	PLANNING PERMISSION
APP PA/2010/1430 – Proposed Class A1 LIDL	Zone 8 – Brigg	213	95	-	PLANNING PERMISSION

- 5.44 The respective schemes in Brigg effectively replace the existing small Tesco and Lidl stores with larger formats; the floorspace detailed above therefore reflects the uplift in floorspace from the existing stores.

¹¹ Net Sales Floorspace not confirmed in application submission; assumption therefore applied on basis of standard Tesco store format.

6. GRIMSBY

- 6.1 The Grimsby catchment defined comprises the survey zones 1 (Grimsby) and 2 (NW Grimsby) which reflect the urban extent. The town is the primary centre in the borough and performs a wider sub-regional role for comparison retail shopping, employment and services (main Council offices).
- 6.2 The town centre retail offer has developed in two distinct areas, as follows:
- **TOP TOWN;** comprises the main shopping areas around Victoria Street and the Freshney Place Shopping Centre (indoor mall). The majority of the national multiples are located within Top Town.
 - **FREEMAN STREET;** historically the main thoroughfare linking Top Town to the docks, the retail prominence of the area has significantly declined. The main retail offer is predominantly small-scale and top-up orientated aside from a large free-standing Asda store at the southern extent of the area.
- 6.3 The town centre retail offer is complemented by retail warehouses at Peakes Parkway (B&Q), Victoria Retail Park (Homebase) and Alexandra Retail Park (Wickes, Matalan, Argos etc.) to the north.
- 6.4 In terms of convenience retailing, the main foodstores around the town are:
- **TOP TOWN;** the main convenience provision in the town centre is Iceland at South St Mary's Gate. This is complemented by the foodhall within the M&S store at Freshney Place and local independents.
 - **FREEMAN STREET;** the main foodstore is a large-format Asda store. Iceland and Farmfoods stores are located midway along Freeman Street area, as well as a number of smaller independent convenience outlets. There is an edge-of-centre Aldi store, albeit physically divorced, to the east along Cleethorpes Road.
 - **OUT-OF-CENTRE;** there are large Sainsbury's and Tesco Extra stores to the north of the town centre. A smaller Asda (former Netto) is located further to the west. A large Morrison's store is located a significant distance to the west of Grimsby.
- 6.5 There are a number of limited assorted discount (LADs) retailers located in the town (Aldi Cambridge Street, Lidl Ladysmith Road). The town also has a well-developed network of local centres which predominantly meet daily top-up shopping needs.
-

- 6.6 Leisure provision within the town as a whole is fairly limited with no cinema or similar large-scale family-orientated entertainment venue.

CONVENIENCE

- 6.7 The overall convenience expenditure pot (Table 3, Appendix 2a) within the Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1) is c. £70.4m (2013); this is projected to rise to £73.1m by 2018 and £83.5m in 2030 (£13.1m increase over emerging local plan period).
- 6.8 The overall convenience expenditure pot within the NW Grimsby catchment (survey zone 2) is projected to rise from £92.4m in 2013 to £94.8m (2018) and £105.1m by 2030 (£12.7m increase over emerging local plan period).

A) MAIN FOOD

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (SURVEY ZONES 1 AND 2)

- 6.9 The main food expenditure pot (Table 4a, Appendix 2a) within the Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1) is projected to rise from c. £52.8m in 2013 to £54.9m in 2018 and £62.6m by 2030. In the same period, the expenditure pot in the NW Grimsby catchment (survey zone 2) is projected to rise from £69.3m to £78.8m.
- 6.10 The main food shopping patterns (Table 5, Appendix 2b) identified in the current household survey (2013) are summarised against the 2005 Study results below:

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	2005 STUDY		2013 STUDY	
	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE ¹²	5.7%	3%	0.6% (£0.3m)	0.6% (£0.4m)
ASDA (FREEMAN STREET)	58.7%	32%	43.2% (£22.8m)	20.7% (£14.3m)
FREEMAN STREET (OTHER) ¹³	5.7%	2%	2.5% (£1.3m)	2.3% (£1.6m)
SAINSBURY'S (CORPORATION RD)	6.7%	10%	8.7% (£4.6m)	7.7% (£5.3m)
MORRISON'S (LACEBY)	6.7%	34%	2.9% (£1.5m)	29.4% (£20.4m)
ALDI (CLEETHORPES ROAD)	3.8%	0%	4% (£2.1m)	0%

¹² 2005 Study does not reference Grimsby Town Centre but instead refers to Victoria Street

¹³ Freeman Street defined as Kwik Save, Netto and Other Convenience Stores in 2005 Study

- 6.11 The survey results show that the main food market share of most destinations has significantly decreased since 2005; this is primarily attributable to the opening of a large out-of-centre Tesco Extra store to the north west of the town in the intervening period.
- 6.12 The market share of Asda in particular has significantly decreased and this is due to the Tesco Extra store effectively competing on a like-for-like basis; the Tesco store is also closer to the town centre and more prominent from the local strategic road network (Victoria Street North and Westgate / A180). The lower impact of Tesco on the Sainsbury's store may be due to the fact that the store is located to the western side of the town and therefore primarily serves local residents in these areas.

INFLOW (FROM WITHIN BOROUGH)

- 6.13 The large mainstream foodstores also draw from a wider area beyond the town's immediate catchment (survey zones 1 and 2). A comparison of the changes since 2005 is set out below:

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH
ASDA (FREEMAN STREET)	15.2%	25.7%	8%	14.3% (£6.1m)	17.2% (£3.7m)	3.5% (£0.9m)
SAINSBURY'S (CORPORATION RD)	1%	10.8%	4%	8.9% (£3.8m)	8% (£1.7m)	10.5% (£2.8m)
MORRISON'S (LACEBY)	5.1%	32.4%	36%	1.5% (£0.6m)	34.2% (£7.3m)	34.1% (£9.2m)

- 6.14 The new Tesco Extra store has also changed main food expenditure flows in the wider borough and has reduced inflows to the Asda store at Freeman Street in particular; the market share which the Morrison's and Sainsbury's stores secured from the respective catchments remains relatively unchanged.
- 6.15 The Tesco Extra, for reference, secures the following main food market share from the respective catchments (survey zones 1 – 5):

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	ZONE 4 – IMMINGHAM	ZONE 5 – RURAL SOUTH
TESCO EXTRA (VICTORIA RP)	10.7% (£5.6m)	13.9% (£9.6m)	2.5% (£1.1m)	14.7% (£3.1m)	3.5% (£0.9m)

- 6.16 However, there is a long standing planning permission for the development of a new full-range Tesco foodstore in Immingham, as part of the planned town centre redevelopment.

- 6.17 This commitment is likely to substantially reduce inflow from the Immingham catchment and potentially the adjoining Barton catchment (survey zone 9) to mainstream foodstores in Grimsby; the committed scheme will rebalance the network of centres in the borough. The prospective reduction in the trading performance of existing foodstores in Grimsby is considered later in this chapter in the capacity review section.

INFLOW (FROM OUTSIDE BOROUGH)

- 6.18 With the exception of the Brigg catchment (survey zone 8), the main foodstores in Grimsby also attract some main food inflows from outside of the borough, as follows:

DESTINATION / STORE	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z9 – BARTON	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z9 – BARTON
ASDA (FREEMAN STREET)	6.7%	4.5%	9.1%	3.4% (£1.4m)	3% (£0.8m)	4.3% (£1.4m)
SAINSBURY'S (CORPORATION RD)	1.3%	3%	3.9%	0.8% (£0.3m)	2.2% (£0.6m)	5.6% (£1.8m)
MORRISON'S (LACEBY)	8%	33.3%	6.5%	5.9% (£2.4m)	16.8% (£4.4m)	8% (£2.6m)

- 6.19 The significant decrease in inflow is primarily due to the opening of a Tesco store in Market Rasen after the 2005 Study was completed. The other changes in inflows primarily relate to the minor impact arising from the opening of the out-of-centre Tesco Extra store in Grimsby, which attracts the following inflow:

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z8 – BRIGG	Z9 – BARTON
TESCO EXTRA (VICTORIA RP)	1.7% (£0.7m)	0.9% (£0.2m)	0.8% (£0.2m)	4.2% (£1.4m)

- 6.20 The decrease in inflow which Asda attracts from the Barton catchment (survey zone 9) is primarily due to the Tesco Extra opening.

LOCAL CENTRES

- 6.21 The survey results indicate local centre provision in Grimsby retains 6.3% (£3.3m) of main food expenditure arising within the immediate Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1); this includes the Lidl stores at Ladysmith Road (2.2%) and Cromwell Road (1.5%). The local centre market share from the NW Grimsby catchment (survey zone 2) is 1.4% (£1m).

OVERALL MAIN FOOD RETENTION

- 6.22 Convenience provision within Grimsby¹⁴ retains 82.1% (£43.3m) of main food expenditure arising within the immediate Grimsby catchment. The main alternative destination outside of the town is the out-of-centre Tesco Extra store in Cleethorpes (12.6% / £6.7m).
- 6.23 The overall retention level increases to 89.5% (£62m) in the NW Grimsby catchment (survey zone 2); Tesco Extra Cleethorpes again is the primary alternative destination outside of Grimsby (9.9% / £6.9m).
- 6.24 There are no outflows of main food expenditure from the Grimsby catchment zones to convenience provision outside of the borough. Consequently, the borough **retains 100%** of main food expenditure arising within the two respective Grimsby catchments; this reflects in part the relative geographic isolation of the borough but also its strong convenience offer.

B) TOP-UP FOOD

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (SURVEY ZONES 1 AND 2)

- 6.25 The top-up expenditure pot (Table 4b, Appendix 2a) within the Grimsby catchment (zone 1) is projected to rise from c. £17.6m in 2013 to £20.8m by 2030. The expenditure pot for the NW Grimsby catchment (zone 2) is projected to rise from £23m to £26m.
- 6.26 The survey results (Tables 6a-6c, Appendix 2b) identify the following changes in market share since the 2005 Study was completed:

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	2005 STUDY		2013 STUDY	
	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE ¹⁵	17.6%	10%	6.9% (£1.2m)	3.1% (£0.7m)
ASDA (FREEMAN STREET)	37.5%	8.3%	25.8% (£4.5m)	3.2% (£0.7m)
FREEMAN STREET (OTHER) ¹⁶	17.6%	1.7%	7.1% (£1.2m)	1.8% (£0.4m)
SAINSBURY'S (CORPORATION RD)	3.8%	5%	7.7% (£1.4m)	7.3% (£1.7m)
MORRISON'S (LACEBY)	2.5%	10%	0.9% (£0.2m)	1.8% (£0.4m)
ALDI (CLEETHORPES ROAD)	1.3%	0%	3.1% (£0.6m)	0%

¹⁴ Town Centre, Freeman Street, Out-of-Centre Foodstores and Local Centres

¹⁵ 2005 Study does not reference Grimsby Town Centre but instead refers to Victoria Street

¹⁶ Freeman Street defined as Kwik Save, Netto and Other Convenience Stores in 2005 Study

- 6.27 Similar to main food shopping, the results show that the top-up market share for most destinations has declined since 2005. The decline in market share which both Top Town (Victoria Street) and Freeman Street draw from the immediate Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1) is particularly pronounced. Whilst the weak top-up food market share which Top Town secures partially reflects the limitations of its offer (predominant sub-regional comparison retail function and offer), the decrease for Freeman Street reflects the wider decline in its shopping and service function (thereby reducing potential activity and linked trips).
- 6.28 The decrease in the market share which Asda secures from the immediate Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1) is not directly attributable to the opening of the new Tesco Extra store; it is likely that the decrease in Asda's market share is reflective of changes in brand loyalty and more a localised pattern of top-up shopping than identified in 2005.
- 6.29 The Tesco Extra store has however had a direct impact on the top-up market share which Morrison's Laceby secures from the NW Grimsby catchment (survey zone 2).

INFLOW (FROM WITHIN BOROUGH)

- 6.30 The large mainstream foodstores in Grimsby attract some top-up food expenditure from outside of the town's immediate catchment (survey zones 1 and 2); the changes since 2005 are set out below:

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH
ASDA (FREEMAN STREET)	4%	0%	4.4%	3% (£0.4m)	4% (£0.3m)	2.1% (£0.2m)
SAINSBURY'S (CORPORATION RD)	0%	1.7%	6.7%	3% (£0.4m)	0%	2.2% (£0.2m)
MORRISON'S (LACEBY)	0%	5%	6.7%	1.1% (£0.2m)	5.3% (£0.4m)	10.9% (£1m)

- 6.31 Given the localised nature of top-up convenience shopping, the expenditure inflows to the main stores are similar to that identified in 2005. The changes set out above may be attributable to brand loyalty rather than any fundamental deficiency (quantitative or qualitative) in provision in Grimsby. Additionally, the opening of the Tesco Extra store in Grimsby since 2005 has not had a significant impact on market shares; this is not surprising given that there was already a full-range Tesco Extra store in Cleethorpes.

INFLOW (FROM OUTSIDE BOROUGH)

- 6.32 There are minimal inflows of top-up food market share spend; the most substantial inflow is from the Market Rasen catchment to Morrison's Laceby (7.1% / £0.6m).

DESTINATION / STORE	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z9 – BARTON	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z9 – BARTON
ASDA (FREEMAN STREET)	3.8%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
SAINSBURY'S (CORPORATION RD)	0%	2.5%	0%	0%	0%	2.5% (£0.3m)
MORRISON'S (LACEBY)	1.9%	2.5%	0%	2.4% (£0.3m)	7.1% (£0.6m)	0%

LOCAL CENTRES

- 6.33 The survey results indicate that a significant proportion of local residents in the Grimsby catchments (survey zones 1 and 2) visit local centres for their top-up shopping goods.

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY
LOCAL CENTRES	9.3% (£1.6m)	51.7% (£11.9m)

- 6.34 The main local centre destinations for local residents in the NW Grimsby catchment are Bradley Cross Road (9.7% / £2.2m), Cromwell Road (19.8% / £4.6m), Scartho Road (6% / £1.4m) and Wingate Parade (5.5% / £1.3m). The prominence of Cromwell Road as a top-up destination is due to the presence of Lidl and Tesco Express stores on Yarborough Road which attracts a significant amount of drive-by trade.

OVERALL TOP-UP FOOD RETENTION

- 6.35 A total of 64.1% (£11.3m) of top-up expenditure arising within the Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1) is retained within it; the main leakage from the catchment is to destinations¹⁷ in the adjoining Cleethorpes catchment (26.6% / £4.7m). There is 5.1% (£0.9m) leakage from the Grimsby catchment to destinations outside of the borough.
- 6.36 The overall top-up retention figure for the NW Grimsby catchment (survey zone 2) is higher at 77.5% (£17.9m); Cleethorpes attracts a further 13.5% (£3.1m). There is limited leakage (9% / £2.1m) outside of the borough from the catchment.

¹⁷ Primary destinations include the town centre and local centres

C) OVERALL MARKET SHARE (MAIN AND TOP-UP COMBINED)

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (SURVEY ZONES 1 AND 2)

6.37 Taking the main and top-up food market shares together, the survey (Table 7, Appendix 2b) identifies that existing provision within the Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1) retains 77.6% (£54.6m) of convenience expenditure arising within its immediate catchment. This increases to 86.5% (£79.9m) for the NW Grimsby catchment (survey zone 2). In respect of individual centres and stores, the survey results identify the following:

	2013 STUDY	
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE ¹⁸	2.2% (£1.3m)	0.7% (£0.6m)
ASDA (FREEMAN STREET)	38.9% (£27.3m)	16.3% (£15.1m)
FREEMAN STREET (OTHER) ¹⁹	3.6% (£2.6m)	2.2% (£2m)
SAINSBURY'S (CORPORATION RD)	8.5% (£5.9m)	7.6% (£7m)
MORRISON'S (LACEBY)	2.4% (£1.7m)	22.5% (£20.8m)
TESCO EXTRA (VICTORIA STREET)	8.3% (£5.9m)	12.1% (£11.2m)
ALDI (CLEETHORPES ROAD)	3.8% (£2.7m)	0%

6.38 The prominent role which local centres perform, particularly for top-up shopping, is highlighted by the following overall market shares:

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY
LOCAL CENTRES	7.1% (£5m)	14% (£12.9m)

6.39 Provision within the Cleethorpes catchment draws 20.1% (£14.1m) and 11.3% (£10.4m) of convenience expenditure arising within the respective Grimsby catchment zones. **The total retained within the borough as a whole from the two Grimsby catchments is 98.7% (£69.5m) and 97.8% (£90.3m) respectively;** there are consequently negligible outflows to other centres outside of the borough from the Grimsby catchments.

¹⁸ 2005 Study does not reference Grimsby Town Centre but instead refers to Victoria Street

¹⁹ Freeman Street defined as Kwik Save, Netto and Other Convenience Stores in 2005 Study

D) FOODSTORE TRADING PERFORMANCE

- 6.40 The survey results (Table 8, Appendix 2b) identify that there is a mixed trading performance of the mainstream foodstores in Grimsby.

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	BENCHMARK	SURVEY TOTAL	DIFFERENCE
ASDA (FREEMAN STREET)	£63.9m	£57.9m	-£6m
SAINSBURY'S (CORPORATION RD)	£31.3m	£25m	-£6.3m
MORRISON'S (LACEBY)	£34.4m	£51.6m	+£17.3m
TESCO EXTRA (VICTORIA STREET)	£40.1m	£25m	-£15.1m
ALDI (CLEETHORPES ROAD)	£3.5m	£4.8m	+£1.3m
ALDI (CAMBRIDGE STREET) ²⁰	£4.3m	£14.4m	+£10.1m

- 6.41 Whilst the opening of the Tesco Extra store in Grimsby has reduced the overall market share and turnover of the Morrison's Laceby store, its continued strong performance is attributable to its strategic location on the local road network which enables it to attract strong inflows from the Immingham, Rural South, Louth and Market Rasen catchments; this is in comparison to the main foodstores within the Grimsby urban area which serve more localised catchments with limited inflow.
- 6.42 However, it is expected that the existing Morrison's overtrading position will substantially reduce once the approved Tesco store in Immingham town centre has been delivered; Morrison's presently attracts a significant quantum of main food expenditure (c. £7.3m) from the Immingham catchment (survey zone 4).
- 6.43 In terms of the other large mainstream foodstores in Grimsby, it is clear that the opening of the Tesco Extra store since the 2005 Study, whilst facilitating a greater degree of choice and competition for local residents, has had a significant impact on the turnover of its immediate competitors (Asda and Sainsbury's).
- 6.44 The current under performance of the main stores points to a potential 'over-provision' of convenience floorspace within Grimsby to the extent that it is unlikely that the main large-format retailers will achieve expected benchmarks.
- 6.45 The strong performance of the two Aldi stores in the town reflects the current gains that limited assorted discounters (LADs) are making from the mainstream operators, the

²⁰ Store has opened since 2005 Study so no comparative analysis completed

ongoing economic climate which has increased shoppers sensitivities to cost and the socio-demographic profile of the local area which LADs traditionally serve.

E) CAPACITY REVIEW

i) TOP TOWN AND FREEMAN STREET (CONSTANT MARKET SHARE APPROACH)

- 6.46 The baseline capacity modelling exercise (Table 10a-b, Appendix 2c), assuming a constant market share and taking account of projected population growth, expenditure growth and trading efficiency increases (notwithstanding increasing special forms of trading (SFT)²¹ deductions), generates the following floorspace requirement²² over the emerging Local Plan period:

MAINSTREAM RETAIL ²³	2018	2023	2030
GRIMSBY TOP TOWN	c. 10 m ² (gross)	c. 25 m ² (gross)	c. 45 m ² (gross)
GRIMSBY FREEMAN ST ²⁴	c. 150 m ² (gross)	c. 385 m ² (gross)	c. 720 m ² (gross)

- 6.47 The baseline capacity identified for **Top Town (Grimsby Town Centre)** over the emerging plan period is clearly insufficient to support any substantive convenience retail development. Whilst ordinarily the relatively low market share (both main food and top-up) which the town centre secures would generate initial quantitative and particularly qualitative needs given the dominance of large out-of-centre foodstores, it is considered that there is no overriding need for the Council to proactively plan for new provision.
- 6.48 The town centre is the main sub-regional comparison retail centre / destination in the borough (and beyond) and its overall vitality and viability, unlike other centres, is not sustained by its convenience shopping function. It is also unlikely in any event that there would be any realistic commercial (operator) appetite for new provision in the town centre given the 'over-supply' position which manifests itself in the poor trading performance of existing stores in and around the town.

²¹ Special Forms of Trading (SFT) deductions set out in Chapter 5 (Retail Study Methodology) and Table 2 of Appendices 2a and 3a.

²² Rounded to nearest 5 metre floorspace increments

²³ Mainstream Retailer is Asda, Morrison's, Sainsbury's and Tesco; Sales Density of £12,000/m² utilised

²⁴ Includes Asda Freeman Street turnover (as per adopted Local Plan retail boundaries)

- 6.49 In relation to **Freeman Street**, whilst a greater need is identified given the inclusion of the Asda turnover, it is our view that there is also no requirement (either spatially or in commercial terms) for the Council to proactively plan for new convenience provision over the emerging plan period. Whilst there are physical issues arising from the connectivity of the Asda store to the wider Freeman Street area given that it is located to the far south west and effectively functions as an out-of-centre store relative to Top Town, it does perform a main food shopping function in the wider locality.
- 6.50 However, the overall convenience turnover of Asda, which is already under-performing relative to expected company benchmark, is likely to further decrease when the Tesco scheme in Immingham is delivered and reverses current inflows to Asda (c. £3.7m).
- 6.51 The identified quantitative need is therefore likely to decrease. Allied to this, there is no real qualitative deficiency given that there are Iceland and Farmfoods stores located within the defined Freeman Street area.
- 6.52 Therefore, it is concluded that there is no requirement for the Council to plan for new provision over the emerging plan period. A future update to this study should however identify needs for the latter phases of the emerging plan. As set out later in the overall strategy, it is our view that the Council should be planning to consolidate Freeman Street as a retail centre in physical terms rather than planning for substantive new development.

ii) GRIMSBY URBAN AREA

- 6.53 Three capacity scenarios have been run for the Grimsby urban area as a whole:
- 1) Projecting forward the baseline convenience turnover of provision within town centre and out-of-centre foodstores on a constant market share basis;
 - 2) The baseline turnover position as detailed above plus inflow arising from tourists / visitors as detailed in the 2012 STEAM Report; and
 - 3) Impact of Tesco Immingham commitment.
- 6.54 The first two scenarios generate the following capacity (Tables 10c-d, Appendix 2c):

MAINSTREAM RETAIL ²⁵	2018	2023	2030
GRIMSBY URBAN AREA [BASELINE]	c. 455 m ² (gross)	c. 1,160 m ² (gross)	c. 2,175 m ² (gross)
GRIMSBY URBAN AREA [INCL. TOURIST INFLOW]	c. 510 m ² (gross)	c. 1,290 m ² (gross)	c. 2,380 m ² (gross)

6.55 Whilst the scenarios begin to identify a notable need for new provision towards the end of the emerging plan period, it does not acknowledge the likely quantitative impacts arising from the new Tesco store in Immingham town centre which will reverse a significant amount of main food expenditure (c. £14.4m) which is presently flowing from the Immingham catchment to mainstream foodstores in the Grimsby urban area.

6.56 The third scenario, which takes into account the potential impact of the Tesco Immingham commitment, identifies the following capacity:

MAINSTREAM RETAIL ²⁶	2018	2023	2030
GRIMSBY URBAN AREA [POST TESCO IMMINGHAM]	c. -1,400 m ² (gross)	c. -620 m ² (gross)	c. 470 m ² (gross)

6.57 As the table shows, there is no quantitative need arising for new convenience provision in the town as a whole until the later phase of the emerging plan period. Overall therefore, there is no need for the Council to proactively plan for new convenience retail provision in the Grimsby urban area over the emerging plan period to 2030; a future update to this study should however be undertaken after the Tesco Immingham commitment has been realised so as to fully establish an up-to-date trading position.

iii) POTENTIAL MARKET SHARE IMPROVEMENT

6.58 There are no quantitative or qualitative deficiencies in convenience provision within Grimsby; all of the mainstream foodstore operators are located to the extent that the assessment finds that most are under-performing aside from Morrison's Laceby which benefits from its strategic location. There are also limited assortment discounters which serve specific market sectors and a variety of local niche operators in a network of local centres around the urban area.

²⁵ Mainstream Retailer is Asda, Morrison's, Sainsbury's and Tesco; Sales Density of £12,000/m² utilised

²⁶ Mainstream Retailer is Asda, Morrison's, Sainsbury's and Tesco; Sales Density of £12,000/m² utilised

- 6.59 The survey assessment identifies existing provision in Grimsby retains 82.1% and 89.5% of main food expenditure arising within its immediate catchment (survey zones 1 and 2 respectively). Whilst there is some leakage, principally to the out-of-centre Tesco Extra store in Cleethorpes, there is limited potential in our view to achieve any further enhancement in market share via clawback. This is supported by the fact that a comparative assessment of the survey results with the 2005 Study identifies that the new Tesco Extra did not facilitate any substantive increase in market share but instead materially competed with existing provision.
- 6.60 On this basis, having regard to existing performance, it is concluded that there is no overriding quantitative need requirement for the Council to identify / allocate an appropriate site for a new convenience retail provision in Grimsby over the emerging Local Plan period.

GRIMSBY COMPARISON

- 6.61 The overall comparison expenditure pot (Tables 4a-d, Appendix 3a) within the Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1) is c. £88.1m (2013); this is projected to rise to £101.1m by 2018 and £129.1m in 2030 (£40.9m increase over emerging local plan period). The overall comparison expenditure pot in the NW Grimsby catchment (survey zone 2) is projected to rise from £124.8m in 2013 to £141.4m (2018) and £175.2m by 2030 (£50.4m increase over emerging local plan period).

A) OVERALL COMPARISON GOODS MARKET SHARE

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (SURVEY ZONES 1 AND 2)

- 6.62 The assessment (Table 18, Appendix 3b) details that as a whole, Grimsby retains 86% (£76m) of all comparison goods expenditure arising within its immediate catchment (zone 1) and 88% (£110m) from the NW Grimsby (zone 2). This highlights strong retention rates for the two zones, with only a negligible amount of expenditure leakage.
- 6.63 Since the 2005 study, the survey results show that the town centre market share for comparison goods has substantially decreased whilst out-of-town centre stores and retail park destinations have increased market share at the same time.

	2005 STUDY		2013 STUDY	
DESTINATION	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE ²⁷	74%	81%	47.7% (£42m)	45.8% (£57.1m)
GRIMSBY FREEMAN STREET ²⁸	-	-	11.6% (£7.3m)	6.3% (£7.9m)
GRIMSBY OUT OF CENTRE ²⁹	15%	12%	26.8% (£23.6m)	35.8% (£44.8m)

6.64 Given that the survey results identify that there is extremely limited leakage to competing destinations outside of the borough, the decrease in the town centre market share is due to a number of factors including:

- The increasing quantum of floorspace dedicated within large foodstores to comparison retailing. The Asda and Tesco Extra stores in the town have a significant non-food offer (particularly clothing) which directly competes with lower order comparison retailers; and
- The change in retailer representation within surrounding retail parks which were historically bulky-orientated.
- The town centre retail offer is predominantly focused on its 'high street' comparison offer (non-bulky) and the overall market share is reduced by virtue of the limited role it performs for bulky orientated goods.

6.65 Finer grain analysis of the town centre market share for individual comparison goods (clothing, major household appliances, DIY goods etc.) is provided below which shows that there is a significant variance in performance.

INFLOW (FROM WITHIN BOROUGH)

6.66 Top Town is the primary comparison retail centre for the borough and the wider sub-region. The survey results identify the following comparison expenditure inflows from the other catchment zones in the borough:

²⁸ Freeman Street includes Asda market share

²⁹ 2005 Study included Alexandra Retail Park, Victoria Retail Park, High Point Retail Park and Peakes Parkway. 2013 Study is summary of Out-of-Centre Foodstores and Retail Parks combined total

	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
DESTINATION	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE	81.7%	68.6%	79.4%	36% (£29.8m)	45.1% (£18m)	48.7% (£25.4m)
GRIMSBY FREEMAN STREET	-	-	-	4.7% (£3.9m)	8.8% (£3.5m)	1.9% (£1m)
GRIMSBY OUT OF CENTRE	6%	20%	14%	27.1% (£22.3m)	32.9% (£13.2m)	26.7% (£13.9m)

6.67 The market share which the town centre secures from the respective catchments in the wider borough has also significantly decreased in all instances since 2005.

INFLOW (FROM OUTSIDE BOROUGH)

6.68 As the primary comparison retail centre for the sub-region, the survey results identify that the town centre (Top Town) draws a significant quantum of trade (as inflow) from the surrounding catchment areas beyond the borough, as follows:

	2005 STUDY				2013 STUDY			
DESTINATION	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z8 – BRIGG	Z9 – BARTON	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z8 – BRIGG	Z9 – BARTON
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE	55%	42%	9%	24%	30.9% (£21.2m)	19% (£8.4m)	6.4% (£3.8m)	13.8% (£8.5m)
FREEMAN STREET	-	-	-	-	1.5% (£1m)	1.8% (£0.8m)	0.1% (£0.04m)	6% (£3.7m)
GRIMSBY OUT OF CENTRE	6%	5%	0%	6%	5.2% (£3.6m)	8.2% (£3.6m)	1.5% (£0.9m)	9.9% (£6.1m)

6.69 Whilst the out-of-centre market share is broadly comparable to that identified in the 2005 Study, it is clear that the town centre has lost a considerable amount of inflow trade from outside of the borough.

6.70 This is in part due to enhanced competition from out-of-centre locations in Grimsby and also the fact that residents are potentially making fewer comparison shopping trips. The latter point is particularly pertinent as less frequent visits means that when they are willing to travel further it is to larger regional centres (e.g. Hull, Leeds, Lincoln and Nottingham) for one main comparison shop due to the higher order offer within those centres. This is particularly relevant in relation to Leeds and Nottingham which have high end comparison (clothing) retailers compared to the mid-range, mainstream fashion offer in Grimsby (Top Town).

- 6.71 The significant decrease in market share from the Louth catchment (survey zone 6) in comparative terms since the 2005 Study may be due to residents to the south and west of the Louth catchment being more inclined to look towards Lincoln as their main comparison shopping destination.

OVERALL COMPARISON GOODS TURNOVER

- 6.72 The town centre (Top Town) comparison retail turnover from the survey area as a whole is £214.2m (Table 18, Appendix 3b); this comprises £172.3m from within the borough (survey zones 1 – 5) and £41.9m from outside the borough (survey zones 6 – 9).
- 6.73 In contrast, the total comparison turnover of Freeman Street is £32.1m whilst the turnover of out-of-centre destinations (foodstores and retail parks) in Grimsby is £132m. The overall turnover of Grimsby as a whole (all destinations combined) is £378.3m.

B) INDIVIDUAL COMPARISON GOODS MARKET SHARES

- 6.74 The survey results for individual comparison goods categories are provided below (Tables 5-17, Appendix 3b). The tables show that there is a significant variance in local residents' destinations for different types of comparison retail shopping.
- 6.75 In contrast to convenience shopping patterns which tend to be more localised in nature, comparison shopping is destination based with shoppers prepared to travel further to undertake shopping for clothing and fashion items in particular; these sectors are the key determinants in consumers choice of destination. Therefore, detailed analysis of the changes in clothing shopping patterns and overall performance of Grimsby as the sub-regional centre for North East Lincolnshire has therefore been completed.

CLOTHING

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (ZONES 1 AND 2)

- 6.76 The expenditure pot for clothing goods in the immediate Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1) is £24.6m; this is projected to rise to £28.2m in 2018 and £36m by 2030. In the corresponding period, the clothing expenditure pot in the NW Grimsby catchment (survey zone 2) is projected to rise from £33.1m to £37.5m and £46.5m respectively.
- 6.77 The changes in market share since the 2005 Study are summarised below:

DESTINATION	2005 STUDY		2013 STUDY	
	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE ³⁰	87.8%	90.6%	73.2% (£18m)	76.7% (£25.4m)
GRIMSBY FREEMAN STREET ³¹	-	-	8.1% (£2m)	5.7% (£1.9m)
GRIMSBY OUT OF CENTRE ³²	5.1%	1%	10.9% (£2.7m)	11.9% (£4m)

- 6.78 The survey results (Table 5, Appendix 3b) identify that the town as a whole (Top Town and Freeman Street combined) has lost some market share since 2005; this is attributable to the notable increase in market share which out-of-centre provision attracts. As previously detailed, it is likely that the change in market share is due to the increasing clothing offer outside of the town centre in terms of the main foodstores in particular.

INFLOWS (FROM WITHIN BOROUGH)

- 6.79 In terms of inflows from within the borough, the survey results identify the following:

DESTINATION	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE ¹⁸	86.3%	87%	92.5%	68.2% (£14.3m)	78.4% (£8m)	81% (£10.4m)
GRIMSBY FREEMAN STREET ³³	-	-	-	0%	8.9% (£0.9m)	1.9% (£0.2m)
GRIMSBY OUT OF CENTRE ³⁴	0%	1.4%	1.5%	4.9% (£1m)	8.7% (£0.9m)	3.5% (£0.4m)

- 6.80 Consistent with the wider survey results, the town centre market share from the wider borough has decreased due to increasing competition from out-of-centre provision.

³⁰ 2005 Study included responses for Victoria Street South Retail Park

³¹ Freeman Street includes Asda Freeman Street market share

³² 2005 Study included Alexandra Retail Park, Victoria Retail Park, High Point Retail Park and Peakes Parkway. 2013 Study is summary of Out-of-Centre Foodstores and Retail Parks

³³ As per footnote 19

³⁴ As per footnote 20

INFLOWS (FROM OUTSIDE BOROUGH)

6.81 The inflows from outside of the borough are also down from the 2005 figures, as follows:

DESTINATION	2005 STUDY				2013 STUDY			
	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z8 – BRIGG	Z9 – BARTON	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z8 – BRIGG	Z9 – BARTON
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE ¹⁸	67.1%	52.4%	16.9%	32.4%	62.3% (£10.6m)	35.3% (£3.7m)	16.7% (£2.5m)	21.8% (£3.4m)
FREEMAN STREET	-	-	-	-	2% (£0.3m)	0.8% (£0.1m)	0%	9.3% (£1.4m)
GRIMSBY OUT OF CENTRE ¹⁹	1.4%	1.6%	0%	1.4%	1% (£0.2m)	2.7% (£0.3m)	0.9% (£0.1m)	2.2% (£0.3m)

6.82 The most substantial decrease in market share has been from the Market Rasen catchment; this could in part be attributable to the opening of a new Tesco store in the town which has a comparison offer.

OVERALL RETENTION / LEAKAGE

6.83 The table below identifies the overall retention level that Grimsby as a whole retains from the borough along with leakage to destinations outside of the borough:

DESTINATION	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH
GRIMSBY ³⁵	92.2% (£22.7m)	94.3% (£31.2m)	73.1% (£15.3m)	96% (£9.8m)	86.4% (£11m)
NE Lincs BOROUGH	95.5% (£23.5m)	97.6% (£32.3m)	82.7% (£17.4m)	97.9% (£10m)	89.1% (£11.4m)
TOTAL LEAKAGE	4.5% (£1.1m)	2.4% (£0.8m)	17.3% (£3.6m)	2.1% (£0.2m)	10.9% (£1.4m)

6.84 Overall, whilst there has been a significant decrease in the town centre market share for clothing due to increased competition from out-of-centre destinations (primarily foodstores), it is clear that Grimsby and the wider borough as a whole retains nearly all clothing expenditure arising within its immediate catchment (survey zones 1 – 5).

6.85 This significantly high retention level reflects the sub-regional status of the town and the relatively discrete (nearly geographically isolated) catchment which it serves; the larger regional centres (Leeds, Hull, Nottingham and Lincoln) are located a significant distance from the borough. Therefore, whilst the centre lacks a higher order clothing / fashion

³⁵ Grimsby overall market share comprises town centre, Freeman Street, out-of-centre foodstores and retail parks

offer, it is the primary location for most local residents due to the significantly long travel distances to other competing centres.

OTHER COMPARISON GOODS

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (SURVEY ZONES 1 AND 2)

- 6.86 A summary of the changes in the market share performance of the **town centre**³⁶ since the 2005 Study for other comparison goods is set out in the table below.

COMPARISON GOODS	2005 STUDY		2013 STUDY	
	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY
FURNITURE / FLOOR	72.2%	87.9%	51.1% (£5m)	48.7% (£6.6m)
DIY	35.1%	39.8%	19.9% (£1m)	7% (£0.5m)
MAJOR HOUSEHOLD APPS	61.6%	68.5%	59.1% (£2.3m)	33.7% (£2.1m)
ELECTRICAL GOODS	62.8%	79.1%	56.4% (£4.7m)	26.2% (£3.3m)
PERSONAL / LUXURY	90.5%	93.7%	85.8% (£3m)	87.2% (£4.5m)
RECREATIONAL GOODS	76.8%	81%	51.4% (£5.8m)	49.5% (£7.7m)

- 6.87 The survey results show that the town centre market share has decreased significantly for all comparison goods aside from personal and luxury. As with clothing, the decrease is primarily attributable to increased competition from out-of-centre locations (mainstream foodstores and retail parks). In all instances, there is extremely limited expenditure leakage from the respective Grimsby catchments to locations outside of the borough.

BOROUGH-WIDE RETENTION

- 6.88 The town centre also secures a significant amount of trade from the other catchment zones within the borough, as follows:

³⁶ Grimsby Town Centre comprises town centre and Freeman Street market share

	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
COMPARISON GOODS	Z3 – C'THORPE	Z4 – I'HAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH	Z3 – C'THORPE	Z4 – I'HAM	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH
FURNITURE / FLOOR	80.5%	66.7%	82%	52.1% (£5.1m)	40.9% (£1.8m)	50.4% (£3.1m)
DIY	58.7%	42.8%	47.1%	4.5% (£0.2m)	16.5% (£0.3m)	8.2% (£0.2m)
MAJOR HOUSEHOLD APPS	78.2%	40.6%	56.7%	29.2% (£1.3m)	21.4% (£0.4m)	38.9% (£0.8m)
ELECTRICAL GOODS	84.3%	44.8%	68.8%	24.5% (£2.1m)	28.8% (£1.2m)	35.4% (£1.7m)
PERSONAL / LUXURY	86.7%	87.9%	96.7%	66% (£2.3m)	85.8% (£1.6m)	87.1% (£2.1m)
RECREATIONAL GOODS	84.6%	82.7%	83.7%	28.9% (£2.5m)	49.7% (£2.4m)	47.9% (£2.9m)

6.89 The town centre market share for the comparison goods, aside from personal goods, has also fallen substantially since 2005; this is again due to out-of-centre competition.

INFLOW (OUTSIDE BOROUGH)

6.90 The changes in inflow from outside of the borough since 2005 are set out below:

	2005 STUDY				2013 STUDY			
COMPARISON GOODS	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z8 – BRIGG	Z9 – BARTON	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z8 – BRIGG	Z9 – BARTON
FURNITURE / FLOOR	56.3%	48%	8.9%	18.6%	31.9% (£2.4m)	29.7% (£1.4m)	3.7% (£0.3m)	11.4% (£0.9m)
DIY	56.2%	24.2%	4.6%	14.1%	7.1% (£0.3m)	7.7% (£0.2m)	0%	7.5% (£0.3m)
MAJOR HOUSEHOLD APPS	46.7%	35.6%	3.2%	17.9%	20.4% (£0.3m)	13.8% (£0.1m)	0%	7.4% (£0.2m)
ELECTRICAL GOODS	43.1%	39%	5%	23.4%	15.8% (£0.9m)	14% (£0.4m)	0%	15.9% (£1.1m)
PERSONAL / LUXURY	53.2%	42.3%	6.9%	29.2%	36.5% (£1.3m)	20.9% (£0.5m)	16.9% (£0.4m)	38.8% (£1m)
RECREATIONAL GOODS	57.4%	34.2%	13.5%	20.5%	45.9% (£3.9m)	15.4% (£0.8m)	0%	16.1% (£1.1m)

6.91 In all instances the market share which the town centre draws from the wider sub-region has decreased. The changes are primarily attributable to enhanced competitions from out-of-centre locations in Grimsby and enhancements in provision in surrounding centres (i.e. Tesco Market Rasen).

C) CAPACITY REVIEW

i) TOWN CENTRE

6.92 On the basis of forward population and expenditure growth, assuming that the current comparison goods market share remains constant, the assessment (Tables 21a-b, Appendix 3c) identifies the following quantitative capacity³⁷ to support new retail provision in Grimsby town centre:

2018	2023	2030
2,720 m ² (gross)	7,185 m ² (gross)	13,855 m ² (gross)

6.93 The quantitative capacity assessment identifies no significant need for the Council to proactively plan for new comparison provision in the town centre (Top Town) in the early phase of the emerging Local Plan (i.e. to 2018). However, there is significant capacity identified for the town centre beyond 2018; this capacity is generated solely on the basis of forward population and expenditure growth.

6.94 Whilst the modelling exercise identifies that the town centre only retains between 45 - 50% of overall comparison goods expenditure arising from its immediate catchment (survey zones 1 and 2), the town centre performs strongly in relation to key 'high street' orientated comparison goods such as clothing (c. 75% market share from both survey zones).

6.95 However, this positive performance, as recognised in the 2005 Study, is reflective of the fact that Grimsby faces limited competition from competing (regional) centres within the study area rather than the overriding strength of its retail offer. As a sub-regional centre, there are several deficiencies (as identified in 2005) in the comparison retail offer:

- The town centre lacks some of the mid-to-higher range fashion retailers normally associated with sub-regional centres; this may in part be attributable to a lack of suitable available retail accommodation in the town centre beyond Freshney Place.
- Whilst there are department stores located within the town centre (House of Fraser and M&S in particular), there are other prominent multiple retailers not currently represented; any addition to the department store offer would therefore deliver significant qualitative benefits in terms of enhancing the attraction of the town centre in the wider sub-region.

- There is a stated desire by local residents for an enhanced range of multiple shops in Grimsby town centre.

- 6.96 Whilst the potential 'up-sizing' of existing retailers into larger more modern floorspace configurations would generate qualitative benefits (enhanced range of goods etc.), the primary aim of any potential quantitative (physical expansion) of the town centre should be to provide new modern retail units to attract new retailers who are not presently represented in Grimsby.
- 6.97 New provision which complements and qualitatively enhances the existing comparison retail offer (particularly clothing and fashion) would be more likely to genuinely achieve a step-change in the performance and importantly the perception of the town centre as a genuine sub-regional destination.
- 6.98 Therefore, notwithstanding that quantitative need only arises in the mid to latter phases of the emerging plan period, it is our view in light of the qualitative-based indicators that the Council should build upon its existing 2009 town centre masterplan to meet the need identified and address existing deficiencies.
- 6.99 The study has already identified through a comparative exercise that the performance of the town centre has declined since 2005 due to increasing competition from out-of-centre foodstores and retail parks in and around the town. The Council must therefore proactively plan to address deficiencies and reverse the current decline in performance.

ii) FREEMAN STREET

- 6.100 The overall comparison retail turnover of Freeman Street is in the order of £32.1m; the majority of this turnover is however derived from the freestanding Asda store (c. £18.9m overall comparison turnover).
- 6.101 As detailed in the 2005 Study and reflected in recent survey assessments (household and floorspace surveys), the viability and overall retail function of the Freeman Street area has significantly declined to the extent that it now performs a minor comparison shopping function in the borough hierarchy.
- 6.102 Whilst there are several local independent retailers located within the existing defined shopping area, the comparison retail offer overall is limited. Given the pre-eminence of Top Town as the sub-regional comparison retail destination for the borough and the wider

³⁷ Floorspace capacity rounded up to nearest five metre increment

sub-region, allied to the significant competition from out-of-centre retail parks and foodstores, it is our view that the potential for Freeman Street to perform a more substantive comparison retail shopping function is limited.

- 6.103 Given the extent of vacancies (some in part arising from proposed redevelopment strategy) in the centre, it is important that the shopping area is physically consolidated into a viable entity which will encourage linked shopping trips with the main Asda store. The priority should therefore be on consolidation and improvement works (i.e. ongoing shop front investment) rather than planning for quantitative-based expansion. We therefore conclude that there is no requirement for the Council to proactively plan for new comparison retail provision at Freeman Street over the emerging plan period. Instead the Council should plan positively for managed consolidation which should include appropriate investment (grant schemes etc.) in shop fronts and public realm. The relocation of businesses to the south of Freeman Street may also assist in creating the critical mass to sustain and attract investment and encourage viable shopping patterns.

iii) GRIMSBY (OVERALL TOWN)

- 6.104 The following modelling scenarios have been run for the Grimsby urban area as a whole:
- 1) Projecting forward the baseline comparison retail turnover of provision within the town as a whole³⁸; and
 - 2) The baseline position plus inflow arising from tourists / visitors as quantified from the 2012 STEAM Report.
- 6.105 The respective assessments (Tables 22b-c, Appendix 3c) identify the following quantitative capacity over the emerging plan period:

MAINSTREAM RETAIL ³⁹	2018	2023	2030
GRIMSBY URBAN AREA [BASELINE]	c. 4,145 m ² (gross)	c. 10,965 m ² (gross)	c. 21,145 m ² (gross)
GRIMSBY URBAN AREA [INCL. TOURIST INFLOW]	c. 4,550 m ² (gross)	c. 12,035 m ² (gross)	c. 23,210 m ² (gross)

³⁸ Excluding the turnover of local centres

³⁹ Mainstream Retailer is Asda, Morrison's, Sainsbury's and Tesco; Sales Density of £12,000/m² utilised

-
- 6.106 Whilst there is no major differences in the capacity identified in the period to 2023 (mid phase of emerging plan), a significant capacity arises (in both respects) by the emerging local plan end date.
- 6.107 In terms of planning for new comparison retail provision on the basis of the need identified, as per the 2005 Study conclusions, it is considered that Grimsby has a good range of retail warehouse provision with the majority of key multiples represented in both the bulky goods but increasingly the comparison retail (high street) sectors.
- 6.108 Given the increasing competition and impact of out-of-centre provision on the town centre since 2005, it is important that new comparison retail development in the town centre is prioritised as substantive new provision coming forward in out-of-centre locations could potentially absorb latent commercial demand.
- 6.109 If bulky retail proposals come forward outside of the plan making process then there is clearly quantitative capacity to support new provision given that it will complement rather than compete with the town centre offer which is predominantly 'high street' comparison orientated. Effective use of planning conditions to restrict the sale of goods would however be essential so as to avoid potential other Class A1 uses (i.e. open consent) coming forward and impacting on the town centre.
- 6.110 Overall, the borough-wide capacity position should be revisited once the deliverability of town centre development site opportunities is fully understood. A future update to this study may be appropriate in this respect.
- |

LEISURE

EXPENDITURE

6.111 The tables below summarise the available expenditure for leisure activities identified by the Experian Goad retail planner reports for the Grimsby and NW Grimsby catchments.

	Z1 - GRIMSBY		Z2 – NW GRIMSBY		
	Average Spend (£)	Available Expenditure (£)	Average Spend (£)	Available Expenditure (£)	UK Average Spend per person (£)
Restaurants/Cafes	273	£12.7m	327	£18.3m	440
Alcoholic Drinks	187	£8.5m	196	£11m	232
Cinema	9	£0.4m	10	£0.6m	18
Theatre / Concerts	15	£0.7m	17	£1m	33
Recreation and Sporting	62	£2.8m	76	£4.3m	117

6.112 The Council's 2012 STEAM report identifies that Grimsby attracts c. £16.5m of tourist (inflow expenditure on recreational goods and £40.9m on food and drink goods. However, it is not possible to disaggregate this overall recreational expenditure figure down into separate (finer grain) leisure based activities as Experian Goad does.

VISITATION PATTERNS

6.113 The main leisure visitation patterns for Grimsby residents are as follows:

- **CINEMA (Z1 - GRIMSBY);** 47.5% of local residents in the catchment regularly visit the cinema. All surveyed residents identified Parkway Cinema at Meridian Point, Cleethorpes as being their most frequent destination.
- **CINEMA (Z2 – NW GRIMSBY);** 61.9% of local residents regularly visit the cinema. Nearly all (98.8%) most regularly visit Parkway Cinema at Meridian Point, Cleethorpes, with the remainder visiting the John Whitgift Academy in Grimsby.
- **INDOOR SPORTS / HEALTH & FITNESS (Z1 – GRIMSBY);** a total of 18.3% of local residents in the catchment regularly use gym facilities. Just under half (40%) use Pure Gym and

19.4% use Virgin Active; both of which are private facilities located in Grimsby. Cleethorpes Leisure Centre (public facility attracts 5.1%.

- **INDOOR SPORTS / HEALTH & FITNESS (Z2 – NW GRIMSBY);** just over a quarter (27.2%) of local residents in the catchment regularly use health & fitness facilities. Grimsby Swimming Pool is the most popular destination (27.5%), followed by Cleethorpes Leisure Centre (18.9%) The FIT Personal Training Studio in Humberston (private), Grange Community Centre in Grimsby (public) and Weelsby Woods (private) facilities all attract 14.3% respectively.
- **TEN-PIN BOWLING (Z1 – GRIMSBY);** a quarter of local residents regularly bowl. The primary destination is Cleethorpes Bowling Alley with 83.9%. The remainder go to Ashby Ten Pin in Scunthorpe.
- **TEN-PIN BOWLING (Z2 – NW GRIMSBY);** a total of 44.3% of local residents regularly bowl. The vast majority (94%) go to Cleethorpes Bowling Alley, with the remainder going outside of the study area to Scunthorpe and Castleford (Xscape).
- **RESTAURANTS / SOCIAL DRINKING (Z1 – GRIMSBY);** 70.7% of residents regularly eat out at restaurant. Cleethorpes is the most popular destination (62.9%). Just over quarter (27.6%) eat out in Grimsby.

Just over half (51.8%) of residents socially drink regularly. The majority socially drink in Cleethorpes (70.1%) followed by Grimsby (17.8%).

- **RESTAURANTS / SOCIAL DRINKING (Z2 – NW GRIMSBY);** 79% of residents regularly eat out at restaurants. Just over half (56.4%) go to Grimsby most regularly. Cleethorpes attracts 28.1% to the town centre and 5.1% to Meridian Point.

With respect to socialising, the survey identifies that 60.3% regularly visit pubs and clubs. The main destinations are Grimsby (45.6%), and Cleethorpes (29.6%).

- **ARTS AND CULTURE (Z1 – GRIMSBY);** 23.9% of local residents in the catchment regularly visit art and cultural facilities; the least of all the catchment zones. Grimsby Auditorium is the most popular destination (28.5%). Also popular are the Caxton Theatre (8.6%), Cleethorpes Library (13.3%) and the Hull Truck Theatre (11.4%). There are some visits to additional facilities outside of the study area (16.3%).
- **ARTS AND CULTURE (Z2 – NW GRIMSBY);** a quarter of residents regularly visit art and cultural facilities. Grimsby Auditorium is the most popular destination (32%). The majority of remaining residents regularly visit attractions outside of the study area.

- 6.114 The survey results show that Grimsby town centre is very much a secondary destination to Cleethorpes in terms of family orientated leisure activities. Whilst the concentration of leisure facilities (cinema, bowling etc.) in Cleethorpes reflects the prominence of the town as a major tourist destination, it is clear that there are significant qualitative deficiencies in leisure provision within Grimsby; the current offer does not reflect its sub-regional status.

NEED / STRATEGY

- 6.115 As detailed above, the town centre evening economy offer lacks any family orientated facilities. The current leisure offer is limited with no mainstream cinema within the town centre since the closure of the Odeon on Freeman Street (closed prior to the 2005 Study). The out-of-centre multiplex at Meridian Point in Cleethorpes is the primary leisure destination for local residents.
- 6.116 Whilst there is a smaller independent cinema at the John Whitgift complex, the cinema forms part of a wider community arts and theatre facility. The existing facility therefore simply cannot compete with the out-of-centre multiplex at Cleethorpes in terms of; the range and frequency of films (it has 1 screen and screenings on specific days of the week), and wider facilities (significant seating capacity, dedicated car parking etc.).
- 6.117 Consequently, whilst there is no clear quantitative deficiency in cinema provision in the borough due to the existing out-of-centre multiplex in Cleethorpes, as per the 2005 Study conclusions, there remains a clear qualitative based need for a new multiplex cinema in Grimsby town centre so as to enhance its family-orientated leisure offer and enable it to effectively perform its intended sub-regional function.
- 6.118 It is considered that a new cinema in Grimsby town centre would not generate significant adverse impacts on the out-of-centre Cleethorpes facility as it is unlikely that tourists (day trippers and those staying in accommodation within the town or the holiday parks to the south) would travel beyond the existing facility to travel to Grimsby. Additionally, it is noted that the existing Cleethorpes facility is located out-of-centre in sequential terms and therefore not protected under NPPF 'town-centre first' policy.
- 6.119 The new cinema in Grimsby would predominantly serve local residents and re-orientate the town centre offer towards something that is commensurate with a sub-regional offer. This is considered in more detail within the Grimsby Development Framework section later in the report (Chapter 9).

7. CLEETHORPES

- 7.1 Cleethorpes is located to the south east of Grimsby; whilst the urban areas of the two towns have coalesced, they remain separate towns with distinct retail and service functions. Cleethorpes serves a discrete local catchment and is a major tourist destination with large holiday parks located to the south. The retail offer for the town provides for the tourist trade as well as for the daily top-up needs of local residents.
- 7.2 The main shopping area in the town centre is focused around St Peter's Avenue (traditional linear high street), Market Place and High Street; the existing provision predominantly comprises traditional terraced shop units. Sea View Street local centre, which is a short distance to the south of the town centre, is a smaller separate niche independent retail destination.
- 7.3 The town centre has a mix of national multiple retailers and local independents. The convenience offer comprises small Co-Op and Sainsbury's Local stores and several independent butchers and grocers along St Peter's Avenue; the provision is predominantly orientated to meeting daily top-up shopping needs. The comparison retail offer is also limited although there are national multiples including Boot's, Superdrug, Peacocks and Clarks.
- 7.4 As a popular tourist destination, Cleethorpes also boasts a wide range of leisure facilities. Within the town centre, there is a variety of bars, restaurants and clubs as well as amusement arcades along the seafront.
- 7.5 Given that the town centre is physically constrained by surrounding residential areas, there is significant out-of-centre development. A large Tesco Extra store is located at Hewitt's Circus Retail Park to the west of the town along with Poundstretcher and Pets@Home retail units.
- 7.6 To the south of the town centre further along the seafront is Meridian Retail and Leisure Park which includes a bowling alley, cinema (Parkway), retail units (Factory Shop and Leading Labels), a gym and drive-through restaurants. Pleasure Island theme park is located just beyond the retail park. There is an extant planning permission to expand the retail park including a hotel and other leisure units.

CONVENIENCE

- 7.7 A separate Cleethorpes catchment (survey zone 3) has been defined covering the town and outlying residential areas including New Waltham and Humbertson. The overall convenience expenditure pot within the Cleethorpes catchment is c. £57.2m (2013) and is projected to rise to £58.9m by 2030 (£1.8m increase over emerging plan period).

A) MAIN FOOD

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (SURVEY ZONE 3)

- 7.8 The main food expenditure in the Cleethorpes catchment (zone 3) is £42.8m in 2013; this is projected to rise to £44.1m by 2030. The current main food shopping patterns (Table 5a, Appendix 2b) are summarised against the 2005 Study results below:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z3 – CLEETHORPES
CLEETHORPES TOWN CENTRE ⁴⁰	4%	2% (£0.9m)
TESCO EXTRA, HEWITTS CIRCUS	61.6%	61.6% (£26.4m)

- 7.9 The survey results indicate that the main food market share which the town centre secures from its immediate catchment has declined since 2005 whilst the out-of-centre Tesco Extra store retains the same market share.

INFLOW (FROM WITHIN THE BOROUGH)

- 7.10 The 2005 Study identified that the out-of-centre Tesco Extra store attracted a significant amount of inflow trade from other catchments within the borough. The table below details the changes between the respective studies:

DESTINATION	2005 STUDY				2013 STUDY			
	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z4 – I'HAM	Z5- RURAL SOUTH	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z4 – I'HAM	Z5- RURAL SOUTH
CLEETHORPES TOWN CENTRE ²⁹	0%	0%	0%	1.3%	0.6% (£0.3m)	0.6% (£0.4m)	0%	0% (£3.1m)
TESCO EXTRA, HEWITTS CIRCUS	11.5%	5%	4.1%	41.3%	12.6% (£6.7m)	9.9% (£6.9m)	0%	24.7% (£6.7m)

⁴⁰ Includes Kwik Save from the 2005 Study

- 7.11 The survey results shows that whilst there has been a minor increase in the main food market share which the out-of-centre Tesco Extra draws from the Grimsby and NW Grimsby catchments (survey zones 1 and 2) respectively, the market share from the Rural South catchment has significantly decreased from 41.3% in 2005 to 24.7%.
- 7.12 The fact that the Tesco Extra has maintained and slightly increased its market share from the Grimsby catchments is particularly surprising given that a comparable Tesco store has opened within Grimsby since the 2005 Study; it is possible that the relatively consistent trade draw of the store from the Grimsby catchments is attributable to its strategic location in comparison to the new Tesco Extra store within Grimsby.
- 7.13 The decrease in market share from the Rural South catchment partially reflects the opening of Tesco Extra in Grimsby (3.5% main food market share) and changes in brand preference with the Sainsbury's and Morrison's stores increasing market share since 2005.

INFLOW (FROM OUTSIDE THE BOROUGH)

- 7.14 The 2005 Study found that the Tesco Extra store draws additional trade from adjacent catchment areas (Brigg excepted) outside of the borough; a comparison with the new survey results is presented below:

DESTINATION	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z9 – BARTON	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z9 – BARTON
CLEETHORPES TOWN CENTRE ²⁹	0%	0%	0%	0%	4.4% (£1.2m)	0%
TESCO EXTRA, HEWITTS CIRCUS	22.7%	6.1%	1.3%	5.5% (£2.3m)	3.5% (£0.9m)	0%

- 7.15 As the table shows, there has been a significant reduction in the inflow which the Tesco Extra store draws from outside of the borough; this is attributable to opening of a new Tesco store in Market Rasen. Future changes in provision in surrounding towns outside of the borough are likely to further reduce inflows.

LOCAL CENTRES

- 7.16 The local centre at Grimsby Road North, which is anchored by a Tesco Express store, retains 11.6% (£3.1m) of main food expenditure arising within the Cleethorpes catchment (survey zone 3). The Tesco Express store also draws 4.7% (£2.5m) of main food expenditure arising in the Grimsby catchment (survey zone 1).

LEAKAGE

- 7.17 The main outflows from the Cleethorpes catchment are to Asda Freeman Street (14.3% / £6.1m) and Sainsbury's Corporation Street (8.9% / £3.8m); the outflows are primarily due to brand loyalty and easier access for residents on the northern side of Cleethorpes to the respective stores in Grimsby.

OVERALL MAIN FOOD RETENTION

- 7.18 When the market share of the town centre, the out-of-centre Tesco Extra and local centres are combined, the survey results identify that existing convenience provision in Cleethorpes retains 67.2% (£28.8m) of main food expenditure arising within its immediate catchment (survey zone 3). Destinations in Grimsby (Freeman Street and out-of-centre) attract a further 32.8% (£14m). The overall retention level within the borough as a whole is 100% with no 'external' leakage.

B) TOP-UP FOOD

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (SURVEY ZONES 3)

- 7.19 The top-up food shopping expenditure pot for the Cleethorpes catchment (zone 3) is £14.3m in 2013; this is projected to rise to £14.7m by 2030 (£0.4m increase). The top-up food shopping patterns (Table 5b, Appendix 2b) identified in the current household survey (2013) are summarised against the 2005 Study results below:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z3 – CLEETHORPES
CLEETHORPES TOWN CENTRE	20%	12.3% (£1.8m)
TESCO EXTRA, HEWITTS CIRCUS	36%	24.5% (£3.5m)

- 7.20 The market share of both the town centre and the out-of-centre Tesco Extra has decreased since 2005; this is primarily attributable to the latest household survey identifying a more localised pattern of top-up shopping with local centres drawing more substantial market shares (29.2% from the Cleethorpes catchment).

INFLOW (FROM WITHIN THE BOROUGH)

7.21 Cleethorpes market share from the wider borough is set out below:

DESTINATION	2005 STUDY				2013 STUDY			
	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z4 – I'HAM	Z5- RURAL SOUTH	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z4 – I'HAM	Z5- RURAL SOUTH
CLEETHORPES TOWN CENTRE ²⁹	1.3%	0%	0%	0%	14.8% (£2.6m)	7.1% (£1.6m)	0%	0%
TESCO EXTRA, HEWITTS CIRCUS	5%	0%	1.7%	6.7%	1.1% (£0.2m)	5.6% (£1.3m)	0%	2.3% (£0.2m)

7.22 The survey results detail that the town centre in particular has significantly increased its top-up market share from the wider borough; this may in part be attributable to the independent convenience offer (butchers, bakers and grocers) absent from Grimsby.

INFLOW (FROM OUTSIDE THE BOROUGH)

7.23 Given the highly localised nature of top-up shopping, there is extremely limited inflow to the main destinations in Cleethorpes from outside the borough. The main notable change is that the out-of-centre Tesco Extra store was identified to be drawing 5.7% of top-up spend from the Louth catchment (survey zone 6) in 2005 but is now not attracting any inflow.

LOCAL CENTRES

7.24 Nearly one third (29.2% / £4.2m) of top-up expenditure within the Cleethorpes catchment is spent in local centres; the main destinations are Trinity Road (13.8% / £2m) and St Peter's Avenue⁴¹ (5.7% / £0.8m).

LEAKAGE

7.25 A total of 19.9% (£2.8m) of top-up expenditure arising within the Cleethorpes catchment is drawn to convenience destinations in Grimsby; there is no particular primary destination and spend is dissipated.

7.26 There is some leakage (10.5% / £1.5m) to other destinations outside of the borough; these outflows are likely to reflect travel-to-work patterns rather than any quantitative or qualitative deficiency in provision in the town.

OVERALL TOP-UP FOOD RETENTION

- 7.27 The town as a whole (including Tesco Extra and local centres) retains 66.9% (£9.4m) of top-up spend arising within its immediate catchment (survey zone 3); destinations in Grimsby draw a further 19.9% (£2.8m). The overall retention level for the borough as a whole from the catchment is 89.5% (£12.8m).

C) OVERALL MARKET SHARE (MAIN AND TOP-UP COMBINED)

- 7.28 The assessment (Table 7, Appendix 2b) identifies that Cleethorpes town centre retains just 4.6% (£2.6m) of total convenience spend arising in its immediate catchment. The out-of-centre Tesco Extra store claims a 52.3% (£29.9m) market share with local centres claiming a further 10% (£5.7m). The town as a whole therefore retains 66.9% (£38.2m) of convenience spend arising within its immediate catchment (survey zone 3).
- 7.29 As convenience destinations in Grimsby draw 29.6% (£16.9m) from the Cleethorpes catchment, the overall retention level for the borough as a whole is 97.4% (£55.6m); the overall amount of leakage outside of the borough is negligible (2.6% / £1.5m).

D) FOODSTORE TRADING PERFORMANCE

- 7.30 Drawing together the main food and top-up market shares for the respective destinations and individual stores, the assessment (Table 8, Appendix 2a) identifies the following trading performance:

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	BENCHMARK	SURVEY TOTAL	DIFFERENCE
SAINSBURY'S LOCAL (Cleethorpes)	£3.6m	£1.7m	-£1.9m
CO-OP (Cleethorpes)	£2.4m	£5.1m	+£2.7m
TESCO EXTRA (Hewitt's Circus RP)	£60.8m	£55m	-£5.8m

- 7.31 Whilst the survey results identify that the Co-Op store is trading above benchmark, the Sainsbury's Local store in the town centre and the out-of-centre Tesco Extra store are identified to be under-performing. However, it is our view that both stores are trading viably; the Sainsbury's Local (as is Co-Op) is likely to attract additional trade from tourists and lunch-time spend whereas Tesco Extra is a main food shopping destination for visitors to the large holiday parks to the south of the town.

⁴¹ Separate local centre to the south of the defined town centre

- 7.32 The Council commissioned STEAM assessment (2012) of tourist spend identifies, once projected forward, in the order of £16.3m of additional tourist spend on convenience goods within Cleethorpes (Table 9b, Appendix 2b). Whilst it is not possible to accurately disaggregate and apportion the tourist spend to individual store destinations, it is probable that the Tesco Extra store in particular secures a significant quantum of this inflow and therefore is likely to trade around or potentially above benchmark. The trading viability of the Tesco Extra store is not particularly pertinent in retail policy terms in any event given that it is an out-of-centre store and therefore is not afforded any NPPF policy protection.

E) CAPACITY REVIEW

i) TOWN CENTRE

- 7.33 The baseline capacity modelling exercise (Table 11a, Appendix 2c), assuming a constant market share and taking account of projected population growth, expenditure growth and trading efficiency increases (notwithstanding increasing SFT deductions), generates the following floorspace requirement⁴² over the emerging Local Plan period:

MAINSTREAM RETAIL ⁴³	2018	2023	2030
CLEETHORPES TOWN CENTRE	c. 20 m ² (gross)	c. 55 m ² (gross)	c. 100 m ² (gross)

- 7.34 The baseline capacity position is clearly not sufficient to support any substantive convenience retail provision in the town over the emerging plan period. However, the baseline assessment is reflective of the current nature of the town centre retail offer which is predominantly orientated to meeting daily top-up shopping needs. The baseline assessment effectively acknowledges the continued dominance of the out-of-centre Tesco Extra store at Hewitt's Circus.
- 7.35 The limitations of the town centre convenience retail offer was recognised in the 2005 Study which identified an overriding qualitative based need for improving provision so as to improve the range and quality of offer. An updated assessment of the realistic need within Cleethorpes and its wider catchment is therefore considered below.

⁴² Rounded to nearest 5 metre floorspace increments

⁴³ Mainstream Retailer (Asda, Morrison's, Sainsbury's and Tesco) Higher Sales Density of £12,000 / m² utilised

ii) CLEETHORPES URBAN AREA

7.36 Consistent with the modelling approach completed for Grimsby, two scenarios have been run to identify capacity in the Cleethorpes urban area as a whole:

- 1) Projecting forward the baseline convenience turnover of the town centre and out-of-centre provision (Tesco Extra) on a constant market share basis; and
- 2) The baseline turnover position as detailed above plus inflow arising from tourists / visitors as detailed in the 2012 STEAM Report.

7.37 The scenarios generate the following quantitative capacity (Tables 11b-c, Appendix 2c):

MAINSTREAM RETAIL ⁴⁴	2018	2023	2030
CLEETHORPES URBAN AREA [BASELINE]	c. 155 m ² (gross)	c. 385 m ² (gross)	c. 730 m ² (gross)
CLEETHORPES URBAN AREA [INCL. TOURIST INFLOW]	c. 190 m ² (gross)	c. 485 m ² (gross)	c. 915 m ² (gross)

7.38 As the table highlights, even with the inclusion of the significant tourist inflow (c. £16.3m in 2013), there is still no substantive quantitative based need for new convenience provision in the town as a whole over the emerging plan period.

iii) POTENTIAL MARKET SHARE IMPROVEMENT

7.39 Whilst Cleethorpes (the town as a whole) presently retains c. 67% of all main food expenditure arising within its defined catchment (survey zone 3), the town centre performs an extremely minor main food shopping function (c. 2% market share).

7.40 The low main food market share reflects the limitations of the town centre offer which is small-scale and predominantly orientated towards meeting daily top-up (basket shop) needs. The two national multiple convenience retailers in the centre (Sainsbury's Local and Co-Op) have a limited range of convenience products in comparison to the out-of-centre Tesco Extra and foodstores in Grimsby (c. 14% / £6.1m main food draw from Cleethorpes catchment).

7.41 As previously detailed, the out-of-centre Tesco Extra store dominates local residents' main food shopping (c. 62% main food retention from the Cleethorpes catchment). However, the store is located a significant distance to the west of the town centre on the edge of the Cleethorpes urban area and is a predominantly car-borne destination.

-
- 7.42 There are consequently significant quantitative and qualitative benefits arising from providing new convenience (foodstore) provision in closer proximity to the town centre.
- 7.43 In quantitative terms, the primary justification for a new foodstore on a sequentially compliant site nearer to the town centre (than the existing Tesco Extra) arises from the potential to:
- Re-distribute existing spend which the dominant out-of-centre Tesco Extra store presently secures from the Cleethorpes catchment; new convenience provision would deliver significant benefits in terms of enhancing choice for local residents.
 - Clawback some of the main food expenditure (c. £6.1m) which is presently flowing from the Cleethorpes catchment to mainstream foodstores in and around Grimsby; the current outflows partially reflect the lack of effective competition.
- 7.44 In terms of the likely trade diversion from the existing Tesco Extra store, whilst it is not possible at this stage to accurately quantify, given the out-of-centre location of the store, any diversion would be acceptable as it is not subject to any formal policy protection.
- 7.45 In terms of the potential to clawback main food expenditure flowing from the catchment to stores in and around Grimsby, whilst this is also dependent on the nature and scale of convenience provision that is ultimately promoted or delivered in Cleethorpes, it is likely that some small increases in main food market share could be achieved.
- 7.46 A hypothetical scenario (Table 11e, Appendix 2c) whereby the main food market share which the town (as a whole) secures from its immediate catchment (survey zone 3) is increased (via clawback) to 75% would generate an additional £3.3m of convenience expenditure to support new provision; this is the maximum retention level that could be achieved in our view given that Grimsby and Cleethorpes have effectively coalesced into one urban entity. A small increase in the town's main food market share from the Rural South catchment (survey zone 5) from 36% to 40% would generate a further £1m.
- 7.47 Overall therefore, whilst there is quantitative support for new convenience provision within Cleethorpes, the capacity justification will largely be based on the nature of the operator and scale of provision that comes forward. It is important within this context that any new mainstream foodstore provision is located on a sequentially preferable site in closer proximity to the town centre than existing out-of-centre Tesco Extra store.
-

⁴⁴ Mainstream Retailer is Asda, Morrison's, Sainsbury's and Tesco; Sales Density of £12,000/m² utilised

7.48 New convenience provision which is located a significant distance from the town centre would effectively replicate the existing position with Tesco Extra and not deliver any of the following qualitative-based benefits to the wider town:

- Enhancing choice and competition for local residents;
- Increasing general accessibility for local residents by non-car modes to appropriate main food shopping facilities within rather than on the edge of the Cleethorpes urban area; and
- Facilitating linked shopping trips and increased general pedestrian footfall activity within the vicinity of the town centre.

7.49 On this basis, and reflecting the overriding conclusions of the 2005 Study, there remains a clear economic and sustainability justification for the Council to proactively identify an available and suitable sequentially compliant site through the emerging plan to meet the quantitative and especially the qualitative need identified.

COMPARISON

7.50 The comparison retail expenditure pot (Tables 4a-d, Appendix 3a) within the Cleethorpes catchment (survey zone 3) is £82.6m (2013); this is projected to rise to £90.6m (2018), £99.4m (2023) and £105.1m by 2030 (£22.5m increase over emerging period).

A) OVERALL COMPARISON GOODS MARKET SHARE

7.51 The survey results (Table 18, Appendix 3b) identifies that Cleethorpes town centre retains just 6.1% (£5m) of all comparison retail expenditure (£83m) arising within its immediate catchment (survey zone 3); the low retention levels reflect the limitations of the existing comparison retail offer in the town centre.

7.52 The town as a whole retains 22.7% (£18.9m) of comparison expenditure arising within its immediate catchment once the out-of-centre Hewitt's Circus Retail Park (primarily Tesco Extra) is taken into account.

7.53 The changes in market share since the 2005 Study are set out below. As the 2005 Study did not quantify the market share performance of the out-of-centre Hewitt's Circus Retail Park, no direct comparison can be completed for Cleethorpes as a whole.

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z3 – CLEETHORPES
CLEETHORPES TOWN CENTRE	3.9%	6.1% (£5m)
HEWITTS CIRCUS RETAIL PARK	-	16.6% (£13.8m)
OVERALL RETENTION	-	22.7% (£18.8m)

- 7.54 The survey results do however highlight that the town centre has increased its market share from its immediate catchment (survey zone 3) since 2005.

INFLOW (FROM BOROUGH)

- 7.55 The survey results identify that the town centre attracts minor inflows (c. £7.7m) from the Grimsby catchments (survey zones 1 and 2); a comparison with the 2005 Study is provided below. There are negligible inflows from the Immingham catchment (survey zone 4) and therefore no summary is provided.

	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH
CLEETHORPES TOWN CENTRE	2.7%	0.1%	1.5%	2.5% (£2.2m)	2.8% (£3.5m)	0.4% (£0.2m)
CLEETHORPES OUT-OF-CENTRE	-	-	-	7.5% (£6.6m)	4.4% (£5.5m)	8.3% (£4.3m)
OVERALL CLEETHORPES	-	-	-	10% (£8.8m)	7.2% (£9m)	8.8% (£4.5m)

- 7.56 Whilst the out-of-centre provision (primarily Tesco Extra) in the Cleethorpes catchment is the main destination for residents in the wider borough, the survey results show that the town centre is maintained and actually enhanced its overall comparison shopping market share from the Grimsby catchments in particular.

INFLOW (FROM OUTSIDE BOROUGH)

- 7.57 Both the town centre and out-of-centre comparison provision in Cleethorpes attracts extremely small inflows from outside of the borough (c. 1.4% / £0.6m from Market Rasen); all other market shares are below 1%.

LEAKAGE / OVERALL RETENTION

- 7.58 The table below highlights that most local residents look towards destinations in and around Grimsby town centre:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z3 – CLEETHORPES
GRIMSBY (TOP TOWN)	81.7%	36% (£29.8m)
GRIMSBY (FREEMAN STREET)	-	4.7% (£3.9m)
GRIMSBY (OUT-OF-CENTRE)	6%	27.1% (£22.3m)

7.59 The significant changes in shopping patterns is the major decrease in Grimsby town centre market share (down by nearly half) and the increase in out-of-centre since 2005; this has been explained in detail in the preceding Grimsby chapter (comparison analysis).

7.60 Taking the market share of Cleethorpes and Grimsby as a whole, the overall quantum of expenditure retained by retail facilities in the borough is 90.7% (£74.9m); this is very high in absolute terms. There is extremely limited leakage to destinations outside of the borough; the leakage is highly dissipated with no primary destination.

B) INDIVIDUAL COMPARISON GOODS MARKET SHARE

7.61 As with the Grimsby analysis, a detailed assessment of clothing shopping patterns and associated market share performance is summarised below. More detailed analysis of individual comparison goods items is provided thereafter.

CLOTHING

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT

7.62 The expenditure pot for clothing within the Cleethorpes catchment (survey zone 3) is £24.6m; this is projected to rise to £28.2m in 2018 and £36m by 2030. The changes in market share since the 2005 Study are set out below⁴⁵:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	ZONE 3 - CLEETHORPES
CLEETHORPES TOWN CENTRE	5.3%	6.2% (£1.3m)
CLEETHORPES OUT-OF-CENTRE	-	3.4% (£0.7m)

⁴⁵ No analysis of Cleethorpes out-of-centre provided as 2005 Study does not specifically record market share

- 7.63 Given the deficiencies in the provision in the town centre, it is positive that the market share has increased (albeit minor) since 2005. The small market share achieved by out-of-centre provision (Tesco) in town reflects the limitations of its own-brand clothing offer.

INFLOW (FROM BOROUGH)

- 7.64 The town centre draws extremely limited market shares from surrounding catchments within the borough; the largest inflow is from the NW Grimsby catchment (0.9% / £0.3m). There are minor inflows to out-of-centre provision in the town (c. £2.6m inflow).

INFLOW (FROM OUTSIDE BOROUGH)

- 7.65 The town centre attracts no inflows from the Louth and Market Rasen (survey zones 6 and 7) catchment zones. The inflow from the Brigg and Barton catchments (survey zones 8 and 9) is extremely limited (c. £0.1m from each zone).

LEAKAGE / OVERALL RETENTION

- 7.66 Given the relatively low market share which the town as a whole retains from its own immediate catchment (survey zone 3), there is significant leakage of clothing expenditure to retail destinations in and around Grimsby; the table below shows the changes since the 2005 Study:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	ZONE 3 - CLEETHORPES
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE ⁴⁶	86.3%	68.2% (£14.3m)
GRIMSBY OUT-OF-CENTRE	0%	4.9% (£1m)

- 7.67 As highlighted, the market share which Grimsby town centre secures from the Cleethorpes catchment has significantly decreased.
- 7.68 Overall, the survey results identify that retail destinations within the borough retain 82.7% (£17.4m) of clothing expenditure arising within the Cleethorpes catchment. There is consequently some leakage with Meadowhall in Sheffield being the primary destination (5.4% / £1.1m); the leakage is however highly dissipated.

⁴⁶ Town Centre includes Freeman Street market share

OTHER COMPARISON GOODS

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT

- 7.69 The survey results indicate that **Cleethorpes town centre** retains relatively low levels of expenditure for individual comparison goods, as highlighted below.

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
COMPARISON GOODS	Z3 – CLEETHORPES	Z3 - CLEETHORPES
FURNITURE / FLOOR	5.2%	4.3% (£0.4m)
DIY	4.3%	4.2% (£0.2m)
MAJOR HOUSEHOLD APPS	0%	0%
ELECTRICAL GOODS	2.2%	0%
PERSONAL / LUXURY	5.3%	7.4% (£0.3m)
RECREATIONAL GOODS	3.1%	12% (£1m)

- 7.70 The results show that the town centre market share has remained relatively consistent since 2005 aside from a significant increase for recreational goods; this is likely to be attributable to the local independent offer in the town which includes specialist angling and equestrian sports shops.

INFLOW (FROM BOROUGH)

- 7.71 The town attracts an extremely limited inflow from surrounding catchments within the wider borough, as set out below⁴⁷:

	2005 STUDY			2013 STUDY		
COMPARISON GOODS	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH	Z1 – GRIMSBY	Z2 – NW GRIMSBY	Z5 – RURAL SOUTH
FURNITURE / FLOOR	5.1%	0%	1.6%	10.2% (£1m)	13.8% (£1.9m)	1.2% (£0.1m)
DIY	1.1%	1.1%	1.5%	0%	3.1% (£0.2m)	0.9% (£0.02m)
MAJOR HOUSEHOLD APPS	1.2%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
ELECTRICAL GOODS	2.3	0%	1.6%	0%	0%	0%
PERSONAL / LUXURY	2.4%	0%	1.6%	2.8% (£0.1m)	0%	0%
RECREATIONAL GOODS	7.1%	0%	0%	1.8% (£0.2m)	0%	0%

⁴⁷ Immingham catchment excluded as negligible inflow to Cleethorpes

- 7.72 The town centre performs relatively well in terms of furniture and flooring but that aside is a limited retail destination for most local residents in the wider borough. Whereas the town centre market share from its own immediate catchment for recreational goods has increased since 2005, it has decreased sharply in terms of the wider borough.

INFLOW (OUTSIDE BOROUGH)

- 7.73 The main changes since the 2005 Study in terms of inflow to Cleethorpes town centre from outside of the borough (survey zones 6 – 9) are summarised below.

	2005 STUDY				2013 STUDY			
COMPARISON GOODS	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z8 – BRIGG	Z9 – BARTON	Z6 – LOUTH	Z7 – M RASEN	Z8 – BRIGG	Z9 – BARTON
FURNITURE / FLOOR	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	1.1% (£0.05m)	0%	1.4% (£0.1m)
DIY	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
MAJOR HOUSEHOLD APPS	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
ELECTRICAL GOODS	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
PERSONAL / LUXURY	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
RECREATIONAL GOODS	1.9%	0%	0%	0%	0%	10.1% (£0.5m)	0%	0%

- 7.74 Unsurprisingly, given the limitations of the town centre comparison retail offer, the survey results show that Cleethorpes only serves a highly localised catchment. The relatively high level of inflow for recreational goods from beyond the borough may be attributable to the specialist sports shops (angling and equestrian) within the town centre. The retail offer is also orientated towards meeting tourist activities.

C) CAPACITY REVIEW

i) TOWN CENTRE

- 7.75 On the basis of forward population and expenditure growth, assuming that the current market share of the town centre is projected forward on a constant basis (i.e. no improvement over time), the capacity assessment identifies the following floorspace requirement⁴⁸ over the emerging Local Plan period to 2030 (Table 23a-b, Appendix 3c):

⁴⁸ Floorspace rounded to nearest 5 square metre increment

2018	2023	2030
205 m ² (gross)	535 m ² (gross)	1,035 m ² (gross)

- 7.76 The identified floorspace capacity is clearly insufficient to support any substantive retail development that would deliver a quantitative and qualitative step-change in the performance of the town centre over the emerging plan period.
- 7.77 Ordinarily, whilst NPPF directs Council's to proactively plan to meet the need identified over the emerging plan period, it is our view that it is unlikely that the town will be able to attract the necessary (national multiple) comparison retailers required to deliver a quantitative and importantly a qualitative step-change in its overall performance.
- 7.78 The town centre comparison retail offer is extremely limited and effectively reflects its intended role within the borough shopping hierarchy. Given its proximity and accessibility to Grimsby town centre, which is the primary sub-regional comparison shopping destination, it is our view that commercial operator demand to locate within Cleethorpes town centre is likely to be significantly constrained.
- 7.79 The town is a clearly secondary centre and given that multiple retailers are rationalising their store representation towards fewer, larger centres (such as Grimsby), there is potentially limited realistic prospects of securing significant quantitative expansion in the town centre comparison retail offer. Additionally, the study has identified a substantive need over the emerging plan period for new comparison retail development within Grimsby town centre; this should be prioritised given the commercial opportunities arising from the town's sub-regional function and the existing critical mass of retailers.
- 7.80 On this basis and consistent with the 2005 Study findings, there is no need for the Council to proactive plan for new provision. The emphasis should be on seeking to continue to qualitatively distinguish Cleethorpes as a shopping and leisure destination in the borough and wider sub-regional hierarchy. It is important to continue to build upon the popular and viable local niche independent offer within the town centre and at Sea View Street local centre.

ii) CLEETHORPES (OVERALL TOWN)

- 7.81 When the survey-based comparison turnover of the main retail destinations in the Cleethorpes urban area (town centre, Hewitt's Circus Retail Park and Meridian Point) are

combined together as a whole, the modelling exercise (Tables 23d-e) identifies the following floorspace capacity on a constant market share basis⁴⁹:

	2018	2023	2030
BASELINE	750 m² (gross)	1, 975 m² (gross)	3,815 m² (gross)
BASELINE [PLUS TOURIST INFLOW]	1,205 m² (gross)	3,190 m² (gross)	6,150 m² (gross)

- 7.82 The assessment identifies under both scenarios (with and without tourist expenditure) that there is limited quantitative capacity until the latter phase of the emerging plan (10 years hence from now). On this basis, it is our view that there is no need for the Council to proactively plan for new comparison retail in the town in the early phase of the emerging plan period. Longer term needs should be based on a future update to this study.
- 7.83 As detailed in the town centre analysis above, Grimsby should be the primary strategic and commercial focus for new comparison retail provision in the borough given the opportunities arising from its wider sub-regional function. There is no currently qualitative deficiency in comparison retail provision outside of Cleethorpes town centre with a full range out-of-centre Tesco Extra store allied to retail warehouses at Hewitt's Circus and Meridian Point.
- 7.84 Any new provision would effectively replicate the existing offer both within Cleethorpes and around Grimsby (full range foodstores and retail parks). Given the proximity and accessibility between the two centres, there is no real economic and sustainability issues arising from local Cleethorpes residents continuing to meet their main comparison shopping needs in the sub-regional centre.

⁴⁹ Capacity presented in 5 square metre increments

LEISURE

EXPENDITURE

7.85 Experian Goad identifies the following quantum of available leisure expenditure (as per specific leisure activity):

	Average Spend (£)	Available Expenditure (£)	UK Average Spend per person (£)
Restaurants/Cafes	£396	£13m	440
Alcoholic Drinks	£216	£7.1m	232
Cinema	£11	£0.4m	18
Theatre / Concerts	£21	£0.7m	33
Recreation and Sporting	£85	£2.8m	117

7.86 The Council's 2012 STEAM report identifies that tourist spending on recreational activities in Cleethorpes (overall town – not location specific) is c. £11.3m. Tourist expenditure on food and drink in Cleethorpes is c. £32.5m. There is no way of disaggregating the recreational expenditure to reflect the finer grain Experian Goad figures.

VISITATION PATTERNS

7.87 As the town centre has an extremely limited leisure offer aside from traditional pubs, the survey results identify that most local residents look towards larger centres and destinations, as follows:

- **CINEMA**; 63.5% of residents in the catchment regularly visit the cinema. As would be expected given its location, all surveyed residents identified the cinema at the out-of-centre Meridian Point scheme as being the most popular destination.
- **INDOOR SPORTS / HEALTH & FITNESS**; a total of 29.8% of local residents in the catchment regularly visit gym facilities. A number of public and private destinations appear to be popular with residents from this catchment including; Cleethorpes Leisure Centre (public) at 29%; La Vive Health Club, Cleethorpes (private) at 24.2%; Virgin Active, Humberston (private) at 17.2%; Grimsby Leisure Centre (public) at 13.3% and; Grimsby Swimming Pool (public) at 9.9%.

- **TEN-PIN BOWLING;** a total of 32.4% of local residents regularly bowl. As would be expected given its location, all surveyed residents identified the bowling alley at Meridian Point as the most popular destination.
- **RESTAURANTS AND SOCIALISING;** a total of 76.6% of local residents regularly visit restaurants. The majority (77.6%) remain in Cleethorpes to eat out; the highest retention rate for eating out of all the catchment areas. The most popular alternative destination is Grimsby Top Town at 17.8%.

In terms of social drinking, 62.1% of residents visit pubs and clubs. Most residents stay within Cleethorpes (71.2%) with a further 13.8% visiting Grimsby Top Town. Small numbers of the remainder go to various village centres as well as Lincoln.

- **ARTS AND CULTURE;** a total of 30.6% of residents in the catchment regularly visit art and cultural facilities. The majority of residents from this catchment go to cultural attractions outside of the study area. Within the study area, however, the Caxton Theatre attracts 17.9% of resident.

7.88 The survey results indicate that the existing out-of-centre Meridian Point leisure facility (multiplex cinema and bowling alley) adequately meets the needs of local residents (and tourists). There will consequently be no commercial demand or potential in our view to attract the operators and facilities needed to further enhance the commercial leisure offer; this is in part reflected by an approved extension to the existing Meridian Point scheme, including new leisure units which have yet to be constructed.

7.89 In terms of the town's wider evening economy offer, whilst there is a concentration of traditional pubs and restaurants along the Alexandra Road frontage, this is orientated towards meeting seasonal (tourist) trade and whilst a qualitative enhancement in provision would be positive for the area, there is no overriding need for the Council to proactively plan for new provision in the town centre. However, appropriate (continued) planning and licencing policies should continue to be applied to avoid the over-concentration of leisure uses which would be detrimental to town centre viability and surrounding residential amenity.

8. IMMINGHAM

- 8.1 Immingham is a small town serving a local catchment to the north west of the borough. The town centre comprises a post-war purpose-built shopping centre (Kennedy Way). There have been long standing (approved) proposals⁵⁰ to partially redevelop the town centre to include a new Tesco foodstore (c. 4,300 m² gross) and retail units. Ongoing revisions to the approved scheme have meant that large parts of the shopping centre are currently vacant awaiting redevelopment.
- 8.2 The retail offer within the centre is limited and is predominantly orientated towards 'top up' shopping. Standalone Co-Op (with Peacocks clothing concession) and Farmfoods stores are located beyond Washdyke Lane to the east.

CONVENIENCE

- 8.3 The overall convenience expenditure pot within the Immingham catchment (survey zone 4) is c. £28.6m (2013); this is projected to rise to £30m by 2018, £31m in 2023 and £33m in 2030 (£4.5m increase over emerging plan period).

A) MAIN FOOD

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (SURVEY ZONE 4)

- 8.4 The main food expenditure pot for the Immingham catchment (zone 4) is £21.4m in 2013; this is projected to rise to £24.9m by 2030 (£3.5m increase over plan period). The main food shopping patterns (Table 5a, Appendix 2b) identified in the current household survey (2013) are summarised against the 2005 Study results below:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z4 – IMMINGHAM
CO-OP, WASHDYKE LANE	-	6.5% (£1.4m)
FARMFOODS, WASHDYKE LANE	-	2.5% (£0.5m)
TOWN CENTRE ⁵¹	14.9%	1% (£0.2m)

⁵⁰ LPA Ref. DC/584/09/IMM.

⁵¹ Town Centre market share in 2005 includes Kwik Save

- 8.5 The survey results show that the market share the town secures from its immediate catchment (survey zone 4) has decreased from 14.9% in 2005 (Kwik Save) to 10% at present. However, there has been a significant change in convenience provision in the town since 2005 with Kwik Save closing and Co-Op and Farmfoods stores opening.

INFLOW (FROM WITHIN THE BOROUGH)

- 8.6 The 2005 Study and the latest survey do not identify any main food inflows from other catchments in the borough; this is primarily attributable to the relatively discrete catchment which the town serves to the north of the borough, and the current limitations of its convenience offer.

INFLOW (FROM OUTSIDE THE BOROUGH)

- 8.7 The respective studies identify negligible inflows of main food expenditure (2.5% / £0.8m) from the Barton-upon-Humber catchment (zone 9); this primarily relates to surrounding villages including North and South Killingholme and Ulceby.

LOCAL CENTRES

- 8.8 Local centres within the Immingham catchment (primarily Sainsbury's Local on Pelham Road) secure a 1.8% (£0.4m) main food market share.

OVERALL MAIN FOOD RETENTION

- 8.9 Existing convenience provision (town and local centres) within Immingham retain just 11.8% (£2.5m) of main food expenditure arising within its immediate catchment (survey zone 4). There are significant outflows (67.1%) of main food expenditure to large mainstream foodstores around Grimsby; the main destinations are Morrison's (34.2% / £7.3m), Asda (17.2% / £3.7m), Tesco Extra (14.7% / £3.1m) and Sainsbury's (8% / £1.7m).

B) TOP-UP FOOD

IMMEDIATE CATCHMENT (SURVEY ZONES 4)

- 8.10 The top-up expenditure pot in the Immingham catchment is projected to rise from £7.1m in 2013 to £8.3m by 2030. The top-up food shopping patterns (Table 5b, Appendix 2b) identified in the current household survey (2013) are summarised against the 2005 Study results below:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z4 – IMMINGHAM
CO-OP, WASHDYKE LANE	-	26.6% (£1.9m)
FARMFOODS, WASHDYKE LANE	-	9.5% (£0.7m)
TOWN CENTRE ⁵²	55% ⁵³	13.8% (£1m)

- 8.11 Overall, despite the significant changes in retailer representation in the town since 2005, the top-up retention level has only decreased from 55% to 49.9% (£3.6m) at present. If the top-up market share (5.1%) of local centres within the Immingham catchment are added to the town's overall market share then the retention level would be directly comparable.

INFLOW (FROM WITHIN THE BOROUGH)

- 8.12 There is no top-up spend inflow to Immingham recorded in either study.

INFLOW (FROM OUTSIDE THE BOROUGH)

- 8.13 The only inflow of top-up-food expenditure to the catchment is from Barton-upon-Humber catchment (survey zone 9) which draws 10.8% (£1.2m); this is comparable to the 2005 Study which identified a 10.5% market share.

LOCAL CENTRES

- 8.14 The Sainsbury's Local store within Pelham Road West local centre secures 5.1% (£0.4m) of top-up expenditure arising within the Immingham catchment.

OVERALL TOP-UP RETENTION

- 8.15 Combining the town centre and local centre market shares together, the assessment (Table 6a, Appendix 2b) identifies that Immingham as a whole retains 55% (£3.9m) of top-up spend arising within its immediate catchment. Grimsby retains a further 24.4% (£1.7m). The overall borough-wide retention level is therefore 79.4% (£5.7m).
- 8.16 Given the relatively low retention levels, there is a notable amount (20.6% / £1.5m) of top-up expenditure flowing from the Immingham catchment to destinations outside of the borough; the primary destination is Keelby in West Lindsey.

⁵² Town Centre market share in 2005 includes Kwik Save

⁵³ Town Centre top-up market share estimated in 2005 Study

C) OVERALL MARKET SHARE [MAIN FOOD AND TOP-UP COMBINED]

- 8.17 The assessment (Table 7, Appendix 2b) identifies that Immingham town centre only retains 20% (£6.5m) of convenience expenditure arising within its immediate catchment (survey zone 4). Convenience provision in Grimsby, primarily large foodstores, claims a 70.4% (£20.1m) market share. There is a limited amount of leakage (7% / £2m) to destinations outside of the borough.

D) FOODSTORE PERFORMANCE

- 8.18 The assessment (Table 8, Appendix 2b) identifies the following trading performance of the main foodstores in Immingham:

DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	BENCHMARK	SURVEY TOTAL	DIFFERENCE
CO-OP (Immingham)	£6.5m	£4.2m	-£2.3m
FARMFOODS (Immingham)	£4m	£2.3m	-£1.6m

- 8.19 As the survey shows, the existing main foodstores in the town are under-performing relative to expected company benchmark; this is reflective of the fact that neither store has a full-range offer which is able to compete with large mainstream foodstores in Grimsby (as reflected in the significant main food leakage from Immingham).

E) CAPACITY REVIEW

- 8.20 Given the relatively low overall convenience turnover that the town generates, the capacity assessment (Table 12a, Appendix 2c) identifies, on a constant market share basis, an extremely limited quantitative need (c. 90 m² gross) for new convenience provision in the town over the emerging plan period.
- 8.21 This baseline capacity position is however based on the current (significant) unsustainable outflows of convenience expenditure from the catchment to Grimsby. Ordinarily, whilst the retail study would advance a clear justification for a new mainstream foodstore to enhance market share through clawback, there is a long standing commitment⁵⁴ for a new full-range Tesco foodstore (4,274 m² gross; 2,975 m² net sales) to be brought forward as part of the redevelopment of the town centre.

⁵⁴ LPA Ref. DC/584/09/IMM

- 8.22 A store of this scale would clearly address the long-standing quantitative and qualitative deficiency in the town and rebalance the existing network of centres in the borough. Therefore, subject to the commitment being realised, there is no requirement for the Council to proactively plan for new development or identify any appropriate sites through the emerging plan period.

COMPARISON

- 8.23 There is a total of £39.9m of comparison goods expenditure (Tables 4a-d, Appendix 3a) arising in the Immingham catchment (survey zone 4). The expenditure pot is projected to rise to £45.6m in 2018, £51.8m by 2023 and £57.2m (£17.3m increase) by 2030.

A) OVERALL COMPARISON GOODS MARKET SHARE

- 8.24 The survey results (Table 18, Appendix 3b) identify that Immingham town centre currently retains just 6.8% (£2.7m) of the overall comparison goods expenditure arising within its immediate catchment (survey zone 4). There are no inflows from adjoining catchments both within and outside of the borough.
- 8.25 The changes in overall comparison market share since 2005 (set out below) shows that the town centre has actually achieved a slight increase in market share despite the current deficiencies in provision and physical environment which will be addressed by the approved Tesco-led redevelopment plans:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z4 – IMMINGHAM
IMMINGHAM TOWN CENTRE	2%	6.8% (£2.7m)

- 8.26 In terms of the main (overall) comparison expenditure outflows from the Immingham catchment, the survey results identify that most local residents look towards provision in Grimsby for their comparison shopping needs:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
DESTINATION / FOODSTORE	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z4 – IMMINGHAM
GRIMSBY TOWN CENTRE	68.6%	53.9% (£21.5m)
GRIMSBY OUT-OF-CENTRE	19.7%	32.9% (£13.1m)

- 8.27 Consistent with the other catchments, the overall change in market share since 2005 has been the increasing market share of out-of-centre locations in Grimsby.
- 8.28 Overall, the borough as a whole retains 95.7% (£38.2m) of comparison goods expenditure arising within the Immingham catchment; there are consequently extremely limited outflows of expenditure to locations outside of the borough.

INFLOW (WITHIN AND OUTSIDE BOROUGH)

- 8.29 Given the limitations of the existing comparison retail offer within the town centre, it is unsurprising that the survey results identify that there are negligible inflows (c. £0.7m in total across the entire study area) to the town centre.

B) OTHER COMPARISON GOODS

- 8.30 Whilst detailed analysis of clothing shopping patterns are provided for both Grimsby and Cleethorpes, the survey results identify that Immingham town centre only retains 0.8% (£0.1m) of clothing expenditure from its own immediate catchment (survey zone 4).
- 8.31 A summary of the changes in the town centre market share for individual comparison goods since 2005 is provided below:

	2005 STUDY	2013 STUDY
COMPARISON GOODS	Z4 – IMMINGHAM	Z4 – IMMINGHAM
CLOTHING	0%	0.8% (£0.1m)
FURNITURE / FLOOR	0%	8% (£0.4m)
DIY	5.7%	2.2% (£0.05m)
MAJOR HOUSEHOLD APPS	8.7%	25.7% (£0.4m)
ELECTRICAL GOODS	9%	15.9% (£0.7m)
PERSONAL / LUXURY	4.5%	0%
RECREATIONAL GOODS	3.8%	0%

- 8.32 The survey results show the town centre performs an extremely limited comparison shopping function; this reflects the limited nature of its offer. The provision of a new mainstream Tesco foodstore in the town centre with an appropriate non-food range should however improve the currently low levels of expenditure retention.

C) CAPACITY REVIEW

- 8.33 On the basis of forward population and expenditure growth, assuming that the current market share of the town centre is projected forward on a constant basis (i.e. no improvement over time), the capacity assessment identifies the following floorspace requirement⁵⁵ over the emerging Local Plan period to 2030 (Table 24a, Appendix 3c):

2018	2023	2030
85 m ² (gross)	225 m ² (gross)	430 m ² (gross)

- 8.34 The baseline capacity is clearly insufficient to support any substantive new comparison retail development that would generate a step-change in the town centre market share and performance over the emerging plan period.
- 8.35 However, the approved Tesco-led regeneration scheme for the town centre will deliver significant benefits in terms of enhancing the choice and range of comparison goods presently available to local residents. The approved scheme includes a new full-range Tesco store (2,975 m² net sales), which would have an appropriate non-food offer, six new retail units (c. 1,670 m² gross overall) and refurbishments / physical improvements to existing retail units.
- 8.36 The scheme will clearly meet local residents' daily convenience and comparison shopping needs and facilitate an enhancement in market share and retention levels; this will deliver attendant economic and sustainability benefits with increased pedestrian activity within the town centre and greater propensity for linked trips.
- 8.37 Therefore, given the current approved scheme, it is clear that there is no requirement for the Council to proactively plan for new comparison retail provision in Immingham town centre over the emerging plan period.

⁵⁵ Floorspace rounded to nearest 5 square metre increment

LEISURE

EXPENDITURE

8.38 The expenditure capacity pot (2013) within the Immingham catchment for specific leisure activities is set out below⁵⁶.

	Average Spend (£)	Available Expenditure (£)	UK Average Spend per person (£)
Restaurants/Cafes	370	£6.1m	440
Alcoholic Drinks	206	£3.4m	232
Cinema	13	£0.2m	18
Theatre / Concerts	22	£0.4m	33
Recreation and Sporting	86	£1.4m	117

8.39 There is no tourist expenditure data available for Immingham; given the location of the town and its lack of tourist facilities and attractions then it is unlikely to attract any inflows.

VISITATION PATTERNS

8.40 In terms of the leisure offer in Immingham town centre, as previously detailed, it is extremely limited with a number of leisure facilities, including a bingo hall and club, having closed. The main leisure offer within the town centre comprises public sports facilities and traditional pubs.

8.41 The survey results identify that most local residents look towards larger centres and destinations, as follows:

- **CINEMA;** 49.6% of residents in the Immingham catchment regularly visit the cinema. The majority (94.7%) visit Parkway Cinema at the out-of-centre Meridian Point facility in Cleethorpes with the remainder visiting cinemas at Scunthorpe and the John Whitgift Academy in Grimsby.
- **INDOOR SPORTS / HEALTH & FITNESS;** 14.7% of residents regularly use the gym. The most visited facility is the Immingham Swimming Pool (29.1%). Public facilities such as Grimsby Leisure Centre and Immingham Sports Centre are also relatively popular,

attracting 12.2% respectively. Private facilities are visited in smaller numbers, including Oasis Academy in Immingham (6%) and Pure Gym in Grimsby (5%).

- **TEN-PIN BOWLING;** a total of 11.6% of local residents regularly bowl. All surveyed residents identified Cleethorpes Bowling Alley at Meridian Point as being the most popular destination.
- **RESTAURANTS AND SOCIALISING;** 71.7% of residents within the Immingham catchment regularly eat out in restaurants. Grimsby (Top Town) is the most popular destination (32.9%) followed by Cleethorpes (16.8%) and Stallingborough Village (12.1%).

In terms of socialising, 44.5% of local residents regularly go to clubs and pubs; most (27.8%) stay within Immingham town centre. Popular alternative destinations for drinking include Stallingborough Village (19.9%), Cleethorpes (19%) and Keelby Village (15.5%).

- **ARTS AND CULTURE;** just under a quarter (24.6%) of residents in the Immingham catchment regularly visit art and cultural facilities. Most (63.4%) visit Hull for cultural attractions. Only 11% of residents stay within the study area and all to visit the Grimsby Auditorium.

- 8.42 Given the highly localised catchment which the town serves in addition to its proximity to the larger centres of Grimsby and Hull, it is unlikely in our view to attract the necessary critical mass (commercial demand) to deliver a step change in offer.

⁵⁶ Experian Retail Planner Reports; Expenditure Pot generated by applying spend per head figure to 2013 population

9. TOWN CENTRE DEVELOPMENT FRAMEWORKS

- 9.1 Having identified the quantitative and qualitative needs for the three main town centres in the borough, it is necessary to draw together all of the analysis (including healthcheck, retail and leisure trends etc.) in order to develop robust centre-specific strategies. It is important in preparing the respective development frameworks to recognise the current different roles of the centres, the physical opportunities and constraints arising as well as the commercial reality in terms of performance and potential for enhancement.
- 9.2 Whilst this study specifically focuses on retail and leisure needs, it is important at the outset that the Council adopts a multi-faceted approach towards development of the three main town centres and the borough as a whole going forward. As recently highlighted in recent research papers on the future of town centres and the high street⁵⁷, strategies should encompass a comprehensive solution, including not just retail and leisure, but health, residential, employment and administrative uses.
- 9.3 There is an increasing requirement for traditional town centres to diversify away from predominant retail and service uses to evolve into flexible multi-functional destinations. Alternative attractions, including public sector anchors such as Council offices and health centres for example, are particularly important in driving footfall, activity and encouraging linked trips within a centre. At the outset, this is particularly pertinent in respect of Grimsby (Top Town).
- 9.4 Therefore, the strategy set out below needs to be linked to a wider review of the overall function and attraction of the three main town centres in the borough.

GRIMSBY (TOP TOWN)

1) RETAIL CONTEXT

- 9.5 The qualitative assessment, informed by a detailed floorspace survey, identifies that the town centre continues to be vital and viable. Whilst there has been a decrease in comparison retail provision and an associated increase in vacancies, these changes

⁵⁷ Recent notable research papers on town centres and the high street include The Grimsey Review – An Future of the High Street.

primarily reflect the ongoing economic / trading climate rather than any significant deficiencies in the town centre offer. The quantum of vacant floorspace within the town centre is below the Experian Goad regional average and is predominantly concentrated in secondary retail areas (i.e. south of Victoria Road West).

- 9.6 The town centre has a strong comparison retail offer concentrated around Freshney Place shopping centre which accommodates a range of mid-range fashion retailers commensurate with the town's sub-regional status.
- 9.7 However, whilst the town centre is performing a sub-regional shopping function, its market share for 'high street' comparison goods, particularly clothing, which is a key driver of shoppers choice of destination, has been significantly eroded since the 2005 Study. Retail provision outside of the town centre, including large full-range foodstores and retail parks, is providing significant competition and has increased market share relative to the town centre in the intervening period since 2005.
- 9.8 Whilst the updated quantitative assessment clearly identifies that the town centre still retains around 75% of clothing expenditure arising from the catchment zones within the borough, it is our view that this strong performance reflects the isolated (geographical) catchment which Grimsby serves rather than the overall strength and quality of its retail offer. There is a lack of competition and it is possible that if higher order (regional) centres were closer and more accessible to local residents then there would be far greater expenditure leakage from the town and the borough as a whole than currently identified.
- 9.9 The relative geographical isolation of the town and its wider catchment from larger centres does however generate opportunities to further enhance the town centre retail and leisure offer going forward, as follows:
- There is a significant local resident ('latent') population in the borough which view Grimsby as the primary shopping destination; both Immingham and Cleethorpes are smaller localised centres which serve daily shopping needs.
 - There is a large transient tourist population and associated spending which the town centre attracts from day visitors (as per the latest STEAM Report (2012) commissioned by the Borough Council).
 - The ongoing trend of mainstream national multiple retailers consolidating their portfolio / representation towards larger towns whereby they can service the needs of a larger catchment from one large store rather than a series of smaller stores in

surrounding (smaller) centres. Grimsby is very much the sub-regional centre for North East Lincolnshire (and beyond).

- The economic and commercial benefits of retailers locating in larger centres (critical mass of retail activity, footfall generation etc.).

9.10 The quantitative assessment identifies that there is a significant need for the Council to proactively plan to deliver new comparison retail floorspace within the town centre through the emerging replacement Local Plan. The new floorspace should seek to address enhance the town centre comparison retail offer in terms of attracting additional mid-range and particularly higher-range fashion retailers normally associated with sub-regional centres.

9.11 The town centre, unlike other comparable sub-regional centres, has several development site opportunities which could meet the need identified in physical and commercial terms within short to medium timeframes; the opportunities are summarised below.

2) RETAIL DEVELOPMENT

9.12 As identified in the 2005 Study and subsequently refined through the 2009 masterplan exercise, there are a number of development site opportunities in and around the town centre to meet future needs; these are identified on the town centre plan at **Appendix 5**.

9.13 Given that there is a particular requirement to consolidate the town centre and more specifically the primary shopping area (as detailed in the next chapter) the **primary focus for new retail development should be on delivering an extension to the Freshney Place shopping centre**. Work is currently underway on reconfiguration of the existing bus station as part of the wider Riverhead Square public realm works which would facilitate future expansion of the Freshney Place shopping centre.

9.14 Whereas the town centre masterplan establishes important design-led principles in relation to the potential extension to Freshney Place shopping centre, it is necessary to move beyond the initial high-level masterplanning exercise and to prepare a **Development and Delivery Strategy** which seeks to genuinely establish:

- The physical quantum of retail development that could be realistically accommodated through an extension to Freshney Place shopping centre and other identified site opportunities thereafter (adopting the sequential approach to site selection based on the recommended consolidated primary shopping area); this

exercise should be informed by a detailed review of the Council and other public sector land assets (existing occupied buildings, car parks etc.).

- The constraints to development (land ownership, physical limitations etc.);
- The realistic timescales for the sites to come forward and be viably delivered (cost / funding, delivery and market factors);
- Current national multiple retailer demand to locate within Grimsby town centre; and
- Commercial market demand and appetite for major development within the town.

9.15 The Development and Delivery Strategy needs to be completed in advance of the emerging plan-making process so as to confirm how the quantitative and qualitative need identified in the study will be realised. If the identified retail development site opportunities in the masterplan cannot be delivered within appropriate timescales then there is potential that high street comparison retail provision could come forward in non-central locations.

9.16 The lack of suitable and deliverable in-centre opportunities would potentially have significant longer-term impacts on the town centre by absorbing latent demand from retailers not presently represented within the town, thereby impacting on the potential commercial viability of delivering in-centre regeneration opportunities which have longer gestation periods than less constrained non-central sites.

3) LEISURE DEVELOPMENT

9.17 Grimsby town centre (Top Town) currently has a traditional 'pub and nightclub' evening economy offer. There is no dedicated cinema facility with local residents and visitors (tourists) having to visit the out-of-centre multiplex at Meridian Point in Cleethorpes. The existing restaurant provision is also orientated towards the lower end of the market with a lack of quality restaurants and family orientated destinations.

9.18 As a sub-regional centre serving a large (latent) catchment, there is a significant opportunity to create a new leisure quarter in the town centre which is anchored by a new multiplex cinema. As with retailing, mainstream cinema operators are concentrating on larger sub-regional centres which serve large catchments and offer opportunities for linked shopping and leisure trips.

9.19 A new cinema multiplex, accompanied by national restaurant chains, would significantly increase dwell time and propensity for linked trips within the town centre and provide a

genuine family orientated focus for the evening and weekend leisure offer, thereby increasing dwell time, footfall and propensity for linked trips to the benefit of the wider town centre.

- 9.20 Given that the existing out-of-centre Cleethorpes multiplex at Meridian Point may potentially constrain commercial demand, allied to the continued evolution of the cinema market in terms of formats and target locations (demographics etc.) the Council should actively seek to establish prospective commercial interest at the outset to identify the appropriate scale and format of provision that could be viably delivered.
- 9.21 If genuine market interest is identified then the Council should as part of its wider Development and Delivery Strategy, build upon the town centre masterplan work (2009) to identify appropriate and importantly deliverable site opportunities.
- 9.22 There are currently two development site opportunities within the town centre (**Appendix 5**) which could potentially accommodate a leisure-led mixed-use quarter, as follows:
- **Freshney Place / River Head;** the area currently comprises a mix of commercial uses including retail warehouses, a modern restaurant parade and offices (Imperial House). The site is adjacent to the reconfigured bus station (work ongoing) and would be suitable for a new cinema multiplex along with ground floor restaurant uses. The site forms a logical physical extension to the primary shopping area and would encourage linked trips.
 - **Wharfside;** whilst physically separated from the town centre by virtue of Frederick Ward Way and River Freshney, the Wharfside site, which has previously been subject to proposals for retail warehouse uses, would be the main alternative site in sequential terms to accommodate a new leisure quarter should the Freshney Place / River Head not be available or suitable.
- 9.23 Subject to completing this strategic exercise, the Council should promote an appropriate opportunity within the town centre to meet the commercial formats required. Land assembly and potential use of CPO powers may be required to bring forward the opportunity within a deliverable timescale.

4) TOWN CENTRE ENHANCEMENT

- 9.24 The existing masterplan identified a series of physical enhancement works and investments to improve the town centre environment (public realm) and deliver a step change in its overall performance. Notable ongoing projects (valuing c. £6 million)

includes, as previously detailed, the redevelopment of the Riverhead Square and the bus station so as to enable the potential future extension of Freshney Place shopping centre.

- 9.25 The other prominent investment in the town centre is physical and environmental improvements to Station Approach, which is the link between the railway station and Freshney Place.
- 9.26 Additional investments should be undertaken on a targeted basis as appropriate; shop front enhancement work and more general physical improvement work along Victoria Street West may be beneficial going forward to improve the interface between Freshney Place shopping centre and the more historic parts of the town centre to the south.

CLEETHORPES

1) RETAIL CONTEXT

- 9.27 As detailed within the quantitative and qualitative analysis, Cleethorpes town centre has a distinct niche independent shopping offer which helps to distinguish it from the more mainstream sub-regional retail provision within Grimsby town centre (Top Town) and surrounding out-of-centre retail provision.
- 9.28 The town centre serves a highly localised catchment and attracts a significant number of tourists from the holiday parks to the south of the town. This significant tourist inflow, whilst helping to sustain the town centre, also generates a significant concentration of service uses; the recent town centre floorspace survey identifies that service uses are significantly above the Experian Goad regional average.
- 9.29 However, in overall comparative terms, there has been little change in the floorspace and fascia composition of the town centre since the 2005 Study. The convenience and comparison retail offer is extremely limited in quantitative terms (small units etc.), reflecting the predominant daily top-up orientated function of the town centre.
- 9.30 A significant positive sign that the town centre is performing well at present is that there are extremely few (three) vacant units within the defined shopping area. The low level of vacancies indicates that the town centre is vital and viable. There are also extremely few vacancies in the smaller local centre at Sea View Street which is a short distance to the south of the town centre.

-
- 9.31 The strong independent retail offer both within Cleethorpes town centre and Sea View Street local centre is a significant strength rather than any weakness or deficiency. The niche complementary function of Cleethorpes has effectively maintained the town's viability given that, unlike other comparable small town centres, it has not lost any key retail anchors due to ongoing rationalisation by national multiples towards larger centres.
- 9.32 This is reflected in the quantitative analysis which indicates that the town centre has improved its overall comparison market share performance (expenditure retention) from its own immediate catchment since the 2005 Study. The town centre market share for clothing has also increased by a similar (minor) amount.

2) RETAIL DEVELOPMENT

- 9.33 The quantitative analysis, including significant tourist inflow, identifies a limited quantitative need for new development in the town in the early phase of the Local Plan up to 2018. On this basis and given that the nature of retail provision required to deliver a step change in the performance of the town centre would effectively replicate existing national multiple retail provision within Grimsby, it is concluded that there is no overriding need for the Council to proactively plan for new comparison retail development.
- 9.34 With respect to convenience retail, the assessment identifies a quantitative and qualitative need for new provision in the town centre, given the limitations of the existing offer (top-up orientated) and the dominance of the large out-of-centre Tesco Extra store at Hewitt's Cross (significant distance from the town centre). A new convenience store would deliver enhanced choice and competition and depending on location would increase accessibility and facilitate linked shopping trips.
- 9.35 Whilst the need identified cannot be operator-specific, a limited assortment (deep) discount operator (Aldi or Lidl) or a higher order convenience retailer (M&S Simply Food) would in qualitative terms provide a specific retail offer which is presently lacking from the immediate catchment; such an operator would complement the existing full-range out-of-centre Tesco Extra store.
- 9.36 However, upon our initial review, the town centre is significantly constrained in terms of development site opportunities given the seafront and surrounding residential areas. However, given the NPPF emphasis on identifying suitable and ultimately deliverable site opportunities to meet identified needs, it recommended that the Council completes an assessment of potential site options so as to genuinely establish (as advocated by the extant PPS4 practice guidance):
-

- The physical quantum of retail development that could be realistically accommodated on any identified site opportunities (gross floorspace);
 - The constraints to development (land ownership, physical limitations etc.); and
 - The realistic timescales for the sites to come forward and be viably delivered (cost, delivery and market factors).
- 9.37 Subject to completing this viability exercise, if an appropriate deliverable sequentially compliant site is identified then it is recommended that the Council should promote the opportunity on a 'twin track' basis by promoting a site-specific allocation and preparing a development brief as appropriate (so as to guide scheme-specific content but to also establish developer and operator demand).
- 9.38 If through the site search process no realistic deliverable opportunities in the town centre are identified, then the Council should, in accordance with NPPF, seek to identify suitable edge-of-centre or failing that out-of-centre sites which are in the most sustainable / accessible locations to accommodate the need identified.

3) LEISURE DEVELOPMENT

- 9.39 The town centre leisure offer comprises traditional evening economy uses including pubs and independent high street restaurants; the offer is aligned to predominantly meet tourist needs. Whilst ordinarily there would be a quantitative and qualitative need to plan to enhance the town centre offer, the out-of-centre Meridian Park scheme, comprising a multiplex cinema and bowling alley, significantly constrains potential demand for new provision within the town centre going forward.
- 9.40 The forward strategy for the town centre in terms of leisure provision should be on managing the existing offer so as to ensure a viable mix of active uses. A series of town centre enhancement actions are set out below.

4) TOWN CENTRE ENHANCEMENT

- 9.41 Given the limited quantitative need identified for Cleethorpes over the early phase of the emerging Local Plan, the key planning policy and delivery strategy for the town centre (including Sea View Street) should be focused on qualitative-based improvements, as follows:
- Maintain and enhance the shopping environment by targeted investment in public realm improvements (street furniture, surfaces, landscaping, signage etc.).

- Enhance existing shop frontages (St Peters Avenue and Sea View Street) so as to promote and qualitatively distinguish Cleethorpes as an attractive independent shopping destination in the borough-wide shopping hierarchy. New shop fronts could further enhance the traditional appeal of the town centre.
- Maintain an appropriate car parking strategy in both spatial (ensuring enough provision) and charging terms so as to encourage drive-by trade.
- Enhance the town centre outdoor market held on Market Street through investing in quality market stalls, new public realm and enhanced advertising / publicity targeted at both local residents and tourists. Specialist markets (i.e. Farmers) could further reinforce / promote the town centre as a niche independent retail centre.
- Maintain and promote effective engagement with local businesses and key stakeholders. The Council should explore the potential to establish a town centre management initiative given that the existing Town Team is primarily focused on resort activities.
- Effectively manage the concentration of evening economy uses so as to ensure that environmental and amenity impacts (blank shop frontages etc.) are minimised. The Council should seek to maintain the existing primary shopping frontage policy for St Peters Avenue in particular to maintain the positive balance of retail and service uses. Appropriate frontage policies for Sea View Street local centre should also be maintained or developed.

9.42 Overall, there is a clear opportunity to further improve the attractiveness of Cleethorpes as a quality local independent orientated town centre in the borough retail hierarchy. The town should continue to complement the mainstream provision within Grimsby town centre and offer a different town centre experience for local residents and visitors alike.

IMMINGHAM

- 9.43 The quantitative and qualitative assessments which underpin the study have clearly identified that the town centre is currently not performing its intended role as the main shopping and service centre / destination for local residents in the north of the borough.
- 9.44 The healthcheck assessment in particular identifies substantial weaknesses in the town centre retail offer with a significant number of vacant units, a poor physical environment

and a lack of genuine choice and quality in terms of existing retail, service and leisure provision or facilities.

- 9.45 The inherent weaknesses in the town centre are reflected in the quantitative elements of the study which identify very low levels of local residents' expenditure being retained in the town centre from the immediate Immingham catchment for both retail (food and non-food) and leisure trips. The quantitative and qualitative deficiencies in provision are reflected in the significant expenditure leakage to mainstream provision within Grimsby (town centre, freestanding foodstores and out-of-centre retail park destinations).
- 9.46 The current under-performance of the town centre does however need to be placed in context of the Council's ongoing commitment to achieve the regeneration of the town centre (i.e. increased vacancies due to closure of some shops in advance of redevelopment). There is extant planning permission for the partial redevelopment / refurbishment of the town centre shopping precinct to include a new full-range Tesco foodstore anchor, new retail units and enhanced public realm.
- 9.47 The implementation of the approved scheme will significantly improve the performance of the town centre in both quantitative and qualitative terms, generating many benefits including:
- Increasing footfall and promoting linked trips with other retail, service and leisure destinations or facilities in the town centre.
 - Enhancing the attractiveness of the town centre in physical and commercial terms through refurbishing the remaining units; delivering a quality landscaping and public realm scheme; and opening up of permeability of the precinct.
 - Reducing the need for travel for everyday shopping needs (a critical element of the extant PPS4 practice guidance). This generates attendant sustainability benefits by reducing outward shopping journeys to Grimsby (town centre, foodstores and out-of-centre retail park destinations) in particular.
- 9.48 The development framework for Immingham has therefore effectively been established through the Tesco-led approved redevelopment / refurbishment scheme which, once delivered, will enable the town to perform its intended role in both spatial and hierarchical terms.
- 9.49 In terms of next steps for the town centre, having regard to the town's localised catchment, its proximity to Grimsby (sub-regional centre) and current commercial trends,

it is our view that there will be extremely limited potential in the short to medium term beyond the Tesco-led scheme to achieve any further substantive development. Retail and leisure operators in particular are currently withdrawing representation from smaller towns such as Immingham. The town serves a relatively discrete local catchment and new retail or leisure provision would essentially replicate and compete with the sub-regional offer in Grimsby.

- 9.50 Overall, Immingham will ultimately perform its town centre function in the shopping hierarchy and adequately serve local residents in the north of the borough. The town centre retail offer will adequately meet local residents weekly (bulk) food shopping as well as everyday top-up shopping needs (including for non-food goods). However, local residents will continue travel to Grimsby for higher order comparison retail goods such as clothing given the sub-regional offer.
- 9.51 An appropriate development strategy for the town centre should be revisited after the Tesco-led scheme has been implemented.

10. STRATEGIC RECOMMENDATIONS

- 10.1 The study has been commissioned to assess the future need for new retail and leisure provision within North East Lincolnshire. The study is informed by a detailed floorspace survey of the three main centres in the borough (Grimsby, Cleethorpes and Immingham) and a robust household survey exercise in order to provide a comprehensive evidence base for the Council and its regeneration partners to proactively plan for future growth. Recommendations on future needs are provided for each specific centre in the preceding chapters. Strategic borough-wide recommendations are set out below.

RECOMMENDATION 1 - PROPOSED BOROUGH HIERARCHY

- 10.2 The existing adopted Local Plan (policy S1) defines the following shopping hierarchy in the borough:
- **SUB-REGIONAL CENTRE;** Great Grimsby, comprising both the Top Town and Freeman Street areas.
 - **TOWN CENTRES;** Cleethorpes and Immingham.
- 10.3 There are also a series of local centres which have been identified in a separate land-use study completed by the Council in 2012.
- 10.4 On the basis of the quantitative and qualitative assessment of each respective centre, the size of the centre, its wider function in terms of its overall shopping and service offer and the number of national multiples represented, it is considered that a revised borough shopping hierarchy is promoted through the emerging plan process, as follows:
- **SUB-REGIONAL CENTRE;** Grimsby Top Town (to be known as Grimsby town centre).
 - **TOWN CENTRES;** Cleethorpes and Immingham.
 - **DISTRICT CENTRE;** Grimsby Freeman Street.
- 10.5 The primary change from the existing adopted hierarchy is that it is proposed to redefine Grimsby Freeman Street as a district centre through the emerging plan process due to (as per Chapter 6 conclusions):

- The extent of vacancies in the existing defined centre; there is a clear requirement to physically consolidate the shopping area into a viable entity which will encourage linked trips and activity.
 - The decreasing importance of Freeman Street as a shopping destination in the borough; the quantitative analysis in particular details that the centre performs a secondary role for comparison retail shopping in particular. The centre also has a limited services and leisure function.
 - Its geographical separation from Top Town and the requirement to distinguish both centres in hierarchical terms so as to enable a viable centre-specific strategy to be developed for both Top Town and Freeman Street.
- 10.6 The current retail study results therefore corroborates the previous 2005 Study recommendations in that Freeman Street should be designated as a district centre to better reflect the type of retail and service uses now found in the existing area.
- 10.7 Additionally, the emerging plan should identify the physical boundaries of the local centres identified in the 2012 Local Centre Study.

RECOMMENDATION 2 – TOWN CENTRE BOUNDARY DEFINITIONS

- 10.8 On the basis of updated (floorspace / fascia) survey fieldwork of the main centres, a series of plans have been prepared (**Appendix 5**) which recommend a series of changes (extensions and deletions) to the saved adopted Local Plan town centre and retail policy area boundaries.

GRIMSBY TOP TOWN

- 10.9 Significant changes are proposed to the existing adopted boundaries for Grimsby Top Town in particular; it is our view (consistent with the 2005 Study) that the town centre boundary should be significantly reduced so as to consolidate the centre and avoid further retail development beyond the town centre ring road. The overall town centre boundary should therefore be redefined to follow Frederick Ward Way to the north and west, Peakes Parkway to the east and the train line to the south; all are defensible physical boundaries. Additionally, a separate primary shopping area (PSA) is defined to cover Freshney Place shopping centre to the north of Victoria Street West.

GRIMSBY FREEMAN STREET

- 10.10 It is proposed to significantly rationalise the existing boundaries so as to consolidate retailing activity towards the southern part. There are significant vacancies to the north and it is our view that the retail provision along Cleethorpes Road effectively functions as a separate local centre.

CLEETHORPES

- 10.11 Given that the uses along the southern extent of Alexandra Road are non-retail (Appendix 4 floorspace survey plan), it is proposed to consolidate the centre to the north. Sea View Street local centre should be separately defined on the emerging replacement policies map.

IMMINGHAM

- 10.12 The existing adopted town centre boundaries for Immingham are relatively well defined given that it largely comprises a post-war purpose-built shopping precinct; only minor changes are therefore proposed to reflect the approved Tesco redevelopment scheme.

RECOMMENDATION 3) FRONTAGE POLICIES

- 10.13 An assessment of the continued appropriateness (or requirement) of defined shopping frontages across the main centres in the borough has been undertaken (**Appendix 5**). However, the Government has recently published new guidance supporting the temporary re-use of existing units within town centre locations to non-retailing activities (i.e. residential or wider commercial uses).
- 10.14 Therefore, aside from protecting primary shopping frontages, particularly within **Grimsby Top Town**, it is not considered that the existing defined secondary retail frontage policies would accord with national policy or provide sufficient flexibility to ensure viable re-use of vacant units. It is our view that secondary frontage policies should not be taken forward through the emerging plan process; the Council should adopt as flexible approach as possible towards attracting new viable uses.
- 10.15 However, frontage policies relating to evening economy uses (Classes A3 – A5 in particular) should be maintained and strengthened where appropriate given the potential social and environmental issues arising from a concentration of these uses.

LOCAL CENTRE BOUNDARIES

- 10.16 The Council has completed a detailed survey of existing local centres and the boundaries should be formalised as either separate inset plans or on a future policies map in order to ensure certainty should any applications come forward.

RECOMMENDATION 4) IMPACT THRESHOLD

- 10.17 NPPF (paragraph 26) confirms that local planning authorities (LPAs) should require an impact assessment for any town centre proposals which are outside of a centre and not in accordance with an up-to-date Local Plan. The 'default' nationally set floorspace threshold of 2,500 m² should apply in the absence of any locally set floorspace threshold.
- 10.18 On the basis of our on-site surveys and the quantitative analysis of centre performance, we recommend that the Council should adopt a **minimum local floorspace threshold of 200 m² for assessment**.
- 10.19 The proposed floorspace threshold would be appropriate given that existing retail units within the historic areas of Grimsby Top Town and the other respective town centres (and proposed district centre) are relatively small. There are identified vacancies in prominent locations within the respective centres and it is our view that a larger locally set floorspace threshold would potentially undermine the re-occupation of existing units.
- 10.20 The Council should actively direct new retail uses towards the existing centres unless there is a defined spatial deficiency in provision (i.e. new local centre required to deliver a sustainable residential development). A lower floorspace threshold would therefore consequently enable the Council to make a balanced planning assessment of the likely trading impacts of new provision on smaller centres.

RECOMMENDATION 5) MONITORING AND MANAGEMENT

- 10.21 The NPPF (and extant PPS4 practice guidance) requires Local Planning Authorities (LPAs) to undertake continuous monitoring of their plans and policies, assessing whether the policies in local development schemes are being achieved. Local Planning Authorities are required to produce annual monitoring reports (AMRs), assessing whether policies are meeting targets, the impact of policies and the need to change policies to reflect changes in national planning policy.

10.22 Consistent with the 2005 Study recommendations, future (annual) monitoring activity by the Council should specifically include:

- The floorspace and fascia composition of the town centres and main retail / leisure park destinations;
- A schedule of planning permissions granted for retail and leisure proposals in the borough (a minimum floorspace schedule may be appropriate);
- Retail and leisure commitments and proposals in the competing centres in the wider sub-region (of a scale to materially influence sub-regional shopping patterns); and
- Development opportunity sites.

10.23 In performing its annual monitoring function, the Council will need to consider the extent to which any changes within the borough and its main centres will impact on the adopted and emerging retail and leisure strategy set out in the Local Plan.